# City of Madison Disparity Study



David Keen, Principal Linsay Edinger, Consultant Keen Independent Research LLC 100 Fillmore St., 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Denver CO 80206 303-385-8515 928-684-3021 (fax) dkeen@keenindependent.com Linsay.Edinger@keenindependent.com

Keith Wiener, Partner Holland & Knight LLP 1201 W. Peachtree St., NW Ste 2000 Atlanta GA 30309 404-817-8515 404-881-0470 keith.wiener@hklaw.com Renée Lauber Lauber Consulting LLC 1252 Morrison Court Madison WI 53703 608-577-9997 LauberConsulting@gmail.com

Stan Davis, Partner Davis & Farley, LLC 1606 Sky Blue Dr Sun Prairie WI 53590 608-469-7208 standavis32@yahoo.com

April 11, 2014 Stakeholder Meeting



### KEEN INDEPENDENT RESEARCH Objectives for Stakeholder Meeting

- 1. Introduce key study team members
- 2. Review U.S. Supreme Court, Seventh Circuit court, and other relevant circuit decisions, and explain why a study is necessary
- 3. Define certain terms and concepts
- 4. Explain key components and schedule for the disparity study
- 5. Explore how we will work interact with businesses and other groups
- 6. Discuss immediate action items



# **INDEPENDENT** 2. Why conduct a disparity study?

- 1989 U.S. Supreme Court decision in *City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Company* established the strict scrutiny standard of review for race-conscious programs adopted by state and local governments
  - Compelling governmental interest
  - Narrow tailoring
- The disparity study will examine whether there is evidence of discrimination against minority- and women-owned firms in the local marketplace, and, if so, what remedies might be appropriate
- Disparity study provides information to help the City:
  - > Determine if the current SBE Program, alone, is an effective remedy
  - > Whether additional or different measures are needed
- Also, outside review of City practices and other policies is useful

## **INDEPENDENT** 3. Terms and concepts in the study

- Small Business Enterprise (SBE)
  - Independently owned and controlled business with annual gross receipts of \$4 million or less when averaged over the past three years
  - Personal net worth maximum of \$1.32 million dollars
- Minority Business Enterprise (MBE)
  - Independent business 51% or more owned and controlled by racial/ethnic affirmative action group members
- Woman Business Enterprise (WBE)
  - Independent business 51% or more owned and controlled by women
- Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)
  - Independent business 51% or more owned and controlled by socially and economically disadvantaged individuals
  - Size restrictions as regulated by the SBA in 13 CFR

## EPENDENT 3. Terms and concepts (cont.)

- Relevant geographic market area
  - Study will focus on the Madison Metropolitan Area contracting marketplace (one federal definition is Columbia, Dane and Iowa counties)
- Availability analysis

KEEN

- What firms are available to perform specific types and sizes of City prime contracts and subcontracts, and what is their race/ethnicity/gender ownership? (through phone interviews)
- What percent of contract dollars might SBE/MBE/WBEs (by group) be expected to receive based on their relative availability and the types and sizes of City prime contracts and subcontracts?
- Calculate by determining availability for each prime contract and subcontract, and then dollar-weighting results
- Utilization analysis
  - > Participation of different groups calculated as their % of total dollars
- Disparity analysis
  - Is utilization of minority- or women-owned firms (by group) less than what might be expected from the availability analysis

## **INDEPENDENT** 3. Terms and concepts (cont.)

- Marketplace analysis
  - Census data and other data on entry and advancement of minorities and women within the contracting industry, business formation, access to capital and business success
  - From the availability interviews, business owners' answers to questions concerning potential barriers in the marketplace
  - In-depth personal interviews with business owners, trade groups, others
  - Input from public meetings
- Analysis of potential remedies
  - Any changes to contracting policies and practices
  - Small business programs, business development programs, technical assistance and other neutral remedies
  - As appropriate, race- and gender-conscious programs such as MBE/WBE contract goals



### 4. Key tasks and potential schedule

incorporating public review of draft report

	2014							2015						
Task Description	MAR	APR	MAY	JUNE	JULY	AUG	SEPT	ост	NOV	DEC	JAN	FEB	MAR	APR
1 Project management, coordination and meetings														
2 Legal framework and analysis														
3 Review of current programs and contracting practices														
4 Data collection for City public works prime contracts and subcontracts														
5 Determination of relevant geographic market area and subindustries for City contracts														
6 Utilization analysis for City public works contracts					<u></u>									
7 Availability analysis for City public works contracts														
8 Disparity analysis for City public works contracts														
9 Quantitative analysis of marketplace conditions						<b></b>								
10 Collection and analysis of anecdotal information														
11 Analysis of remedies									Inte			ternal		
12 Reports, presentations and study documentation									revi			eview		
Proposed meetings with Study Oversight Committee		*	*						*				*	

#### KEEN INDEPENDENT RESEARCH 4. Key tasks and schedule (cont.)

- Reports, presentations and study documentation
  - Draft report
    - Initial draft report is intended for review by the project manager, other City staff and the Oversight Group
    - > Draft report will be made available to the public for review
    - > Will receive comments through review period
    - > 2 public meetings to receive public comments
  - Final report
  - Two sets of study team presentations



- 5. Communication and input from businesses/other groups
- Meeting with stakeholders
- Meetings with trade associations and other groups
- Press release, study website, dedicated email address
- Telephone interviews with business owners and managers
- 40 in-depth personal interviews with business owners and trade associations
- Opportunities for any interested individuals or groups to submit comments
- 2 public meetings
- Public distribution of draft (and receive comments) and then final report
- Final presentations

## EPENDENT 6. In next six weeks, the City/Keen Independent will ...

- Announce study via press release, website
- Inform key groups about the study

KEEN

- Start preparing legal framework and analysis
- Receive and review electronic data
- Review materials concerning City contracting practices
- Meet with City staff to discuss public works contract and subcontract data, and contracting processes
- Analyze distribution of contract dollars by location of contracts and by types of work
- Begin quantitative analyses of the local marketplace
- Design availability interviews for local businesses
- Initiate in-depth personal interviews with trade associations, chambers and other groups