



Report to the Plan Commission

March 4, 2013

Legistar I.D. #29093
3934 Manitou Way
Demolition Request

Report Prepared By:
Heather Stouder
Planning Division Staff

Requested Action: Approval of the demolition of a single family home for the construction of a new single-family home in the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 1) District.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 28.185(7) provides the guidelines and standards for the approval of demolition requests.

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolition can be met, and **approve** the request.

Background Information

Applicant/Contact/Property Owner: Kevin and Jill Carey; 3934 Manitou Way; Madison, WI, 53711

Proposal: The applicant proposes to demolish a single-family home for the construction of a new single-family home in the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 1) District.

Parcel Location: 3934 Manitou Way is located on the northwest corner of Manitou Way and Mandan Crescent; Nakoma National Historic District; Aldermanic District 10 (Solomon); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions: The approximately 12,000 square foot property has a two-story, 2,377 square foot single-family home constructed in 1924.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning: Surrounding single-family homes to the north, west, and south are in the TR-C1 District. The Nakoma Golf Course, across Manitou Way to the east, is in the PR (Parks and Recreation) District.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan (2006) recommends Low Density Residential uses for this area.

Environmental Corridor Status: These properties are not located within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: The area is served by a wide range of urban services, including access to Metro Transit Route 19 on Nakoma Road to the north.

Zoning Summary: The property is in the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 1) District.

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area	8,000	14,200 sq. ft.
Lot width	60'	84.40'
Front yard setback	20'	22'
Side yard setback	One story: 6, Two story: 7	7'
Reverse corner side yard setback	15	30.6'
Rear yard setback	Lesser of 30% or 35'	35'
Maximum height	2 stories/35'	2 stories
Maximum lot coverage	50%	adequate
Usable open space	1,000 sq. ft.	adequate

Site Design

No. Parking stalls	0	2
Building forms	Yes	Meets requirements

Other Critical Zoning Items: Utility easements

Prepared by: Pat Anderson, Asst. Zoning Administrator

Project Description, Evaluation, and Conclusion

The applicant proposes to demolish the existing 2,377 square foot, 4-bedroom home for the construction of a 4,204 square foot, 4-bedroom home. The applicant has noted several deficiencies in the existing two-story structure, including a leaky basement, settling sun porch, and an outdated electrical system. Having thoroughly explored options to remodel and add to the existing home, the applicant has determined that the most economical choice is to demolish the existing home and construct a new home that meets all of the needs of the household.

As proposed, the site would maintain a functional front entrance from Manitou Way and driveway access from Mandan Crescent into a 3-car attached garage, which has a stacked parking arrangement so as to appear from the street as a two-car garage. The driveway to the garage leads from an existing curb cut that is shared with the driveway to the neighboring home. This would still be the case, but the shared curb cut would be widened a few feet to the south, and the space between the two driveways would be landscaped to create more of a visual separation between the two properties. Exterior materials on the home include white brick, fiber cement siding, and black trim.

During the demolition and construction, a stone monument signifying the entrance to the neighborhood will remain undisturbed. A 22-inch maple tree in the southwest corner of the site will remain, and while the applicant will attempt to ensure the viability of the 10-inch crabapple tree on the southwest corner of the site, it is unlikely due to its proximity to the proposed front porch. The applicant has indicated a willingness to plant a replacement tree on the property.

Demolition- The existing home is a contributing structure within the Nakoma National Historic District, where tax credits are available to make structural and other improvements. The applicant has discussed the shortcomings of the existing home with the City's preservation planner, and understands the incentives available to maintain the existing home. He had strongly considered rehabilitating the existing structure, but after spending a significant amount of time and money on the design for a remodel, has concluded that a new home would best suit the needs of the household.

In their November 12, 2012 meeting, the Landmarks Commission reviewed demolition proposals that had recently been listed on the City's demolition listserv, including the subject property. Their discussion concluded with a recommendation that the Plan Commission deny this demolition request, since this home is a contributing structure in the Nakoma National Historic District where tax credits are available to rehabilitate the items listed as reasons for demolition.

The preservation planner notes that it is unfortunate to see a contributing structure demolished, especially when tax credits could support electrical updates, foundation repairs, and many other items pertinent to this structure. However, the building is not protected by local ordinances, and the proposed home is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan recommendation for low density residential uses in the area. Staff has carefully reviewed the request, and believes that the demolition standards can be met for the proposal. However, the Plan Commission should consider the input from the Landmarks Commission and preservation planner as part of their decision.

No thorough assessment has been done to explore relocation of the existing structure, but based on a site visit, it appears that relocation would be very difficult from a practical standpoint. This is due in part to tight neighborhood streets, and also to the lack of suitable receiving properties nearby (nearly all of the homes in this area are contributing structures in the historic district).

Proposed Site and Building – The proposed site plan meets all of the requirements of the TR-C1 Zoning District. The home sits approximately seven feet further away from the neighboring property to the west than the existing home, and the new open porch on the east side of home sits approximately eight feet closer to Manitou Way. The 4,200 square foot home is larger than others in the immediate area, most of which range from 2,500 to 3,200 square feet, but is not altogether out of character with the eclectic mix of houses surrounding it.

Public Input - Several neighbors have indicated support for the proposal (see attached document), the Alder is supportive, and staff is unaware of any neighborhood opposition at this time.

After careful consideration, staff believes that the demolition approval standards can be met, and recommends that the Plan Commission **approve** the request, subject to input provided at the public hearing and comments and conditions from reviewing agencies below.

Recommendations and Proposed Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are shaded

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

Staff recommends that the Plan Commission find that the demolition and conditional use standards can be met, and **approve** the request, subject to input provided at the public hearing and comments and conditions from reviewing agencies below.

The following conditions have been submitted by reviewing agencies:

Planning Division (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

1. Exterior materials shall be labeled on elevations submitted for staff review and approval.
2. Final plans submitted for staff review and approval shall include a replacement canopy tree similar in mature size to the crabapple tree that will likely be lost due to the placement of the new home.

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Dailey, 261-9688)

3. Drainage patterns shall be maintained to not adversely affect adjacent properties and to convey runoff to the street.
4. The Applicant shall replace all sidewalk and curb and gutter which abuts the property which is damaged by the construction or any sidewalk and curb and gutter which the City Engineer determines needs to be replaced because it is not at a desirable grade regardless of whether the condition existed prior to beginning construction (POLICY).
5. All work in the public right-of-way shall be performed by a City licensed contractor (MGO 16.23(9)(c)5 and MGO 23.01).

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

6. MGO Section 28.185(7)(a)5 requires that if a demolition or removal permit is approved, it shall not be issued until the reuse and recycling plan is approved by the Recycling Coordinator, Mr. George Dreckmann (608-267-2626).
7. MGO Section 28.185(10) states that every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185(7)(a)5 shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 266-4420)

8. Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D and SPS 382.30(3)(e). Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition website: <http://www.homesprinkler.org/Consumer/ConsHome.html>
9. Please consider allowing Madison Fire Department to conduct training sequences prior to demolition. Contact MFC Training Division to discuss possibilities (608) 246-4587.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

10. The Madison Water Utility shall be notified to remove the water meter prior to demolition.
11. This property is not in a wellhead protection district. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility.

Traffic Engineering (Contact Scott Langer, 266-5987)

This agency did not submit a response for this request.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not submit a response for this request.

Parks Division (Contact Kay Rutledge, 266-4714)

This agency did not submit a response for this request.