

**PLANNING DIVISION REPORT
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND COMMUNITY
AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
May 19, 2008**

RE: I.D. # 09982: Zoning Map Amendment I.D. 3348, Rezoning of 31 S. Henry Street from C4 to PUD-GDP-SIP

1. Requested Actions: Approval to rezone the property from C4 (Central Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development Plan-General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan) to allow a renovation and building addition creating a total of 59 apartment units with first floor retail and office space.
2. Applicable Regulations: Section 28.12 (9) provides the process for zoning map amendments. Section 28.07 (6) of the Zoning Ordinance provides the requirements and framework for Planned Unit Developments.
3. Report Prepared By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Planner

GENERAL INFORMATION

1. Applicant: Cliff Fisher; Governor of Madison, LLC; P.O. Box 1601; Madison, WI 53701
Agent: David Ferch, Architect; 2704 Gregory St; Madison, WI 53711
2. Development Schedule: The applicant estimates construction would begin in June 2008 with project completion scheduled for January 2009.
3. Location: Approximately 10,800 square foot lot at the southeast corner of West Washington Avenue and South Henry Street; Aldermanic District 4; Madison Metropolitan School District.
4. Existing Conditions: The site includes an existing three-story building, originally constructed as the St. Raphael Cathedral School and Covenant. The building was sold and converted to office space in the 1970s.
5. Proposed Land Use: The applicant proposes to add three floors to the existing structure for a total of six stories. The building will be converted into an apartment building with 59 total units and ground floor retail, office, and restaurant space.
6. Surrounding Land Use and Zoning: Current zoning and land use are summarized as follows:

North: Office, zoned C2 (General Commercial District)
South: St. Raphael's Cathedral Site, zoned C4 (Central Commercial District)
East: Office, zoned C2 (General Commercial District)
West: Capitol West Mixed-Use Development, Zoned PUD-SIP

7. Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan includes the subject property within the “Downtown Core”. The recommended uses include “mixed-use buildings with first story retail/dining/entertainment/service/office and upper story residential uses.” No specific density limit is established and the plan recommends densities of 60 dwelling units per acre and higher in this area. The Bassett Neighborhood Plan includes similar recommendations.
8. Environmental Corridor Status: The property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.
9. Public Utilities & Services: The property is served by a full range of urban services.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

This application is subject to the standards for zoning map amendments and planned unit development districts.

PLAN REVIEW

The applicant requests approval to rezone the property from C4 (Central Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development Plan-General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan) to allow a building addition and renovation creating 59 apartment units and ground floor retail and office space. The proposal does not meet C4 standards for usable open space or dwelling unit mix and therefore, planned-unit development zoning is necessary to complete the project as proposed.

Surrounding Context and Existing Conditions

The subject site is located at the corner of West Washington Avenue and South Henry Street, two blocks from the Capitol Square. The fire-damaged St. Raphael’s Cathedral sits south of the subject property. Multi-story office buildings are located to the north and east. The Capitol West mixed-use redevelopment project is just west of the site, including an 11-story retail and residential building that is under construction. The Metropolitan Place Condominiums are located just west of the project area on West Washington Avenue.

The existing building is a three-story, masonry-clad structure, originally built as a school and covenant for St. Raphael’s. It was sold and converted into an office building in the 1970s. The building includes a masonry facade and is roughly 23,000 square feet in area. The mass of the structure is pulled close to the West Washington Avenue right-of-way, with a prominent “saw-tooth” design along Henry Street.

Proposed Addition and Renovations

The applicant proposes to add three additional floors to the building. The new upper floors sit directly atop the lower levels, preserving the prominent saw-tooth design along Henry Street. Total proposed building height would be 73.5 feet, with a small portion of the building on West Washington up to 81 feet tall. The plans also show the addition of a new restaurant space at the corner of Henry Street and West Washington Avenue. This addition would be a one-story projection, placed close to the street edge. The remainder of the first floor would be converted into additional retail or office space.

Completion of the project would yield 48,348 square feet of total building area, with 4,970 square feet for the first floor restaurant and retail areas. The residential component of the project includes 59 total units, with 25 efficiencies, 24 one-bedroom units and 10 two-bedroom units. The applicant provided more diversity in unit mix after staff raised concerns with the original concept that included only efficiency and one-bedroom units.

General Building Layout

The entrance to the restaurant and upper floor apartments is located on West Washington Avenue. The applicant is resolving the final location of the restaurant entrance and this condition is one of several established by the Urban Design Commission to be resolved at the time of final UDC approval. The main door to the rear retail and office space is located on South Henry Street.

The residential units on each floor would be oriented off a central hallway. Upper-floor units will include balconies, however no units will have separate outdoor entrances.

Building Design

The building design and materials have changed as the project moves through the Urban Design Commission process. The most current elevations are included in the Plan Commission packet. The masonry and stone on the original three floors is maintained on each of the plan iterations. The original plans submitted to the Plan Commission showed the new restaurant projection and upper floor addition clad in synthetic stucco. The revised plans receiving initial UDC approval have substituted the synthetic stucco for cement siding on the upper floors. Two colors of this 18 inch-wide siding will be used, differentiating the saw-tooth projections. This siding is intended to have an architectural block-type appearance. The edge of each projection will be lined with cut stone, matching the stone on the original lower floors. The upper floor windows align with those on the original floors. The base of the proposed one-story projection is clad in a stone veneer, matching the existing base stone.

Landscape Plan

Landscaping is limited to small planting areas at the perimeter of the building. Current plans show the planting of several yews in the small West Washington Avenue setback. Other small planting areas are proposed along Henry Street, in the area defined by the saw-tooth projections. Plantings include spirea adjacent and three honey locust trees, as shown in the attached plans.

Parking

There is no off-street automobile parking proposed for this project. The applicant proposes to include 64 bicycle-parking stalls with 59 inside the building and five (5) outside. The indoor bike parking is located at the rear of the first floor and accessed by a hallway running the length of the building. The neighborhood has requested the applicant explore options for adding on-site moped parking. The applicant has discussed very preliminary options with planning staff, however, no provision for moped parking is included in the current submittal.

Zoning Text

The applicant's zoning text lists permitted uses as those listed in the C4 zoning district, matching those allowed with the parcel's current zoning. Other bulk and design requirements including height, yard, and landscaping requirements would be "provided as shown on the approved plans."

Although shown on the plans, outdoor seating areas for the restaurant are not listed as a permitted use.

ANALYSIS

Conformance with Comprehensive Plan

The subject property is located within an area defined as the "Downtown Core" in the Comprehensive Plan. Mixed-use buildings, such as the proposed project are recommended uses. The proposed project has a density of over 250 dwelling units per acre. The Comprehensive Plan recommends that densities in this area can exceed 60 dwelling units per acre, however, a specific density limit is not established. The Bassett Neighborhood Plan, adopted in 1996 includes the subject site within the "State Capitol Area" and includes similar recommendations.

Design Considerations

The applicant received initial Urban Design Commission approval on April 23, 2008 and a copy of these minutes is attached. Planning staff note two significant issues being considered by the

UDC. The first is the cement panel siding proposed as the primary building material on the upper floors. The elevation drawings appear improved over earlier concepts, however, the material is considered “new” and staff are not aware of comparable applications. The second issue is improving the appearance of the one-story restaurant projection including concerns over materials and front door location. These and other design issues must be resolved prior to final approval of the UDC. Further information should be also be provided for planning staff approval, as these design issues are resolved.

Dwelling Unit Mix

The applicant’s original submittal included only efficiency and one-bedroom units. Staff requested the applicant diversify the dwelling unit mix to include more multi-bedroom units. In that discussion, the applicant indicated that there was little market feasibility for apartments with three or more bedroom units as no on-site parking would be available. However, the applicant did revise the unit mix which now includes 10 two-bedroom units, accounting for roughly 17% of the building’s total dwelling units.

Outdoor Seating Area

The applicant’s plans identify “future” outdoor seating areas, both on-site and in the West Washington Avenue right-of-way. The proposed zoning text does not explicitly include outdoor seating as a permitted use. Staff recommend that the future outdoor seating area be approved as an amendment to the SIP, requiring Plan Commission approval. At this time, no operational information is available to further evaluate such a proposal and with the close proximity the upper-floor residential units, such detail is necessary to assess its potential impacts.

Inclusionary Zoning

The proposed building included in this proposed planned unit development will consist entirely of rental units, so the project is not subject to inclusionary zoning regulations.

CONCLUSION

The Planning Division believes the proposed addition and renovation is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and Basset Neighborhood Plan. The proposed density is over 250 dwelling units per acre, however, neither plan recommends a specific maximum density in this area. In considering the context, the adjoining blocks include large residential and mixed-use projects such as Metropolitan Place and the Capitol West and therefore, staff believe the project is not inconsistent with the size and scale of the surrounding area.

The Urban Design Commission granted initial approval of this project on April 23, 2008 and the applicant has made significant changes to the building design since the original submittal.

Exterior materials have most notably changed, and the applicant now proposes to use cement board siding on top of the building's original masonry base. This material is intended to have an architectural block appearance and staff are not aware of other applications of this material. The remaining design issues, as noted in the UDC minutes, must be resolved prior to receiving final UDC approval.

Staff believe that the project could meet applicable review standards, provided the remaining design issues are addressed and the conditions stated below are met.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for zoning map amendments and planned unit developments met and forward Zoning Map Amendment 3348, rezoning 31 South Henry Street from C4 (Central Commercial District) to Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan & Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP) with a recommendation of **approval**, subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions listed below.

In the alternative, if the Plan Commission believes more information on design related issues is necessary, the Commission could refer the project to a future meeting, pending final approval of the Urban Design Commission.

1. Comments from reviewing agencies.
2. That the applicant resolve the remaining design issues noted in the minutes of the Urban Design Commission and that the applicant obtain final Urban Design Commission approval prior to final staff sign-off of the zoning map amendment.
3. That the applicant add a note to the site plan indicating that on-site outdoor eating areas are not included in this approval and shall be considered by the Plan Commission as an alteration to the SIP.
4. That the developer submit proof of financing and an executed contract with a construction firm, which provides assurances that the project will be completed once started, in a form acceptable to the Director of the Department of Planning and Community & Economic Development prior to any permits being issued.
5. That the applicant provide a mock-up of the proposed cement siding materials for Planning staff approval.

ID #09982
31 South Henry Street
May 19, 2008
Page 7

6. That final design of the restaurant projection be provided for Planning staff approval.