

PLANNING UNIT REPORT
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT
March 6, 2006

RE: I.D. # 02871: Zoning Map Amendment I.D. 3163, rezoning One University Square from PUD-GDP-SIP to Amended PUD-GDP-SIP

1. Requested Actions: Approval of a request to amend a previously approved PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development, General Development Plan; Specific Implementation Plan) for University Square to allow demolition of the existing one-story commercial center and construction of a mixed-use development that will contain a 350-unit apartment tower, 134,000 square feet of retail space and a 236,500 square-foot University of Wisconsin student services center tower.
2. Applicable Regulations: Section 28.07 (6) of the Zoning Ordinance provides the requirements and framework for Planned Unit Developments; Section 28.12 (9) provides the process for zoning map amendments; Section 28.04 (22) provides the guidelines and regulations for the approval of demolition permits. This project is also subject to the Capitol View Preservation building height restrictions in Section 28.04 (14).
3. Report Prepared By: Timothy M. Parks, Planner.

GENERAL INFORMATION

1. Applicant: Susan Springman, Executive Management, Inc.; 2901 International Lane; Madison.

Property owners: Madison Real Estate Properties (c/o EMI) and the University of Wisconsin.

Agent: Rick Gilbertson, Potter Lawson, Inc.; 15 Ellis Potter Court; Madison.

2. Development Schedule: The applicants will commence demolition in June 2006, with a schedule completion of the project scheduled for September 2009.
3. Location: Approximately 3.4 acres bounded by East Campus Mall on the west, University Avenue on the north, N. Lake Street on the east and W. Johnson Street on the south, Aldermanic District 8; Downtown Design Zone 2; Madison Metropolitan School District.
4. Existing Conditions: The site consists of four one-story commercial buildings organized around a central courtyard, with a variety of retail and service providers including the University Square Theatres, Paisan's restaurant and many others. A metered public surface

parking lot (Lot 47) is located between the western edge of the site and the western wall of the commercial center.

5. **Proposed Land Use:** The site will be redeveloped with a mixed-use development containing a 350-unit apartment tower, 134,000 square feet of retail space on the first two floors above grade and a 236,500 square-foot University of Wisconsin student services center tower. The project will provide structured parking for approximately 425 automobiles.
6. **Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:** The properties immediately surrounding the subject site are largely included in the University of Wisconsin Campus. The Fluno Center and Southeast Campus Parking Ramp are located east of the site; the Peterson Office Building is located to the northwest; Vilas Communications Hall is located to the west; Ogg Residence Hall and Gordon Commons are located to the south. A row of four privately-held commercial buildings are located east of the Peterson Office Building on the north side of University Avenue opposite the site in C2 zoning, including Brothers and The Red Shed taverns.
7. **Adopted Land Use Plan:** The Comprehensive Plan includes the site in the framework of the larger, surrounding University campus and provides a secondary recommendation for a transit-oriented development site.
8. **Environmental Corridor Status:** The property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.
9. **Public Utilities & Services:** The property is served by a full range of urban services.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

This application is subject to the demolition standards of Section 28.04 (22) and the Planned Unit Development District standards. In addition, the site is located in Downtown Design Zone 2, which includes the following specific criteria for consideration of planned unit developments:

(e) Lot Area, Lot Width, Height, Floor Area Ratio, Yard, Usable Open Space Requirements, Signs And Off-Street Parking Requirements For Planned Unit Development Districts With Residential Components That Are Located In Downtown Design Zones. Requirements other than those specifically listed below shall be consistent with the Exterior and Interior Design Criteria for Planned Unit Development Districts with Residential Components in Downtown Design Zones (Design Criteria) adopted by resolution by the Common Council. The required setbacks for all yards in Planned Unit Development Districts with residential components in Downtown Design Zones shall not apply to any parking structure that is constructed entirely

below the existing ground level, which shall mean the natural or existing ground level prior to construction. All such requirements are made a part of an approved recorded precise development plan agreed upon by the owner and the City and shall be, along with the recorded plan itself, construed to be an enforced as a part of this ordinance.

Downtown Design Zone 2:

- a. **Height.** No building or structure shall have more than ten (10) stories unless an applicant meets the additional criteria for up to two (2) additional stories, as set out in the Design Criteria. *(excerpted)*
- b. **Floor Area Ratio.** The floor area ratio shall not exceed 6.0.
- c. **Yard Requirements**

Front Yard – The front yard shall be a minimum of fifteen (15) feet.

Side Yard – For lots greater than or equal to sixty (60) feet wide, the side yards shall be a minimum of twelve (12) feet on one side and ten (10) feet on the other side.
[None of the other criteria for side yards in this district apply to this site/ project.]

Rear Yard – The rear yard shall be a minimum of twenty-five (25) feet.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

On December 13, 2005, the Common Council granted approval of a request to rezone One University Square from C2 (General Commercial District) to Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan (PUD-GDP) to allow future development of a mixed-use development with up to 350 apartment units, approximately 130,000 square feet of retail space and a 225,000 square-foot University of Wisconsin student services center tower upon demolition of the existing one-story commercial center. The approval included a specific implementation plan (PUD-SIP) to provide zoning continuity for the existing building until demolition and construction of the mixed-use development commences in 2006 following approval of this amended specific implementation plan detailing the new project.

PLAN REVIEW

The applicants are requesting final approval of planned unit development zoning for 3.4 acres of land bounded on the west by East Campus Mall, University Avenue on the north, N. Lake Street on the east and W. Johnson Street on the south. The site is developed with the approximately 70,000 square-foot University Square commercial center, which was first developed in the mid-1970s. The center is comprised of four buildings organized around a central courtyard and joined by a central roof system and includes a number of small retail and service uses as well as the University Square Theatre. The architecture of the buildings features white, stucco-like finished walls and blue metal standing-seam roofs evocative of the period the site was developed in its

current iteration. Most of the center's users are oriented on the central courtyard, resulting in building walls facing the perimeter streets that lack openings to give the center street presence. The remainder of the site includes the University of Wisconsin's Lot 47 surface parking lot, which is located adjacent to the western wall of the center.

The area immediately surrounding the site is primarily developed with University of Wisconsin facilities, including Gordon Commons and Ogg Hall across W. Johnson Street, the Fluno Center and Southeast Campus Parking Ramp east across N. Lake Street, Vilas Communications Hall west of Lot 47, and the Peterson Office Building to the northwest across University Avenue. The remainder of the University Avenue frontage opposite the subject site is occupied by four buildings hosting a variety of commercial uses, zoned C2, including two bars located at the corner of N. Lake Street. The recently adopted Comprehensive Plan incorporates the University Square site into the "Campus" designation for the surrounding University campus and includes a note proposing a future transit-oriented development for the property.

The planned unit development proposes demolition of the existing commercial center to accommodate a new mixed-use facility that will include a 350-unit apartment tower, 134,000 square feet of retail space on the first two floors above grade and a 236,500 square-foot University of Wisconsin student services center tower. Parking for the 826,000 gross square-foot mixed-use building will be provided by approximately 425 structured parking spaces.

A high-profile two-story building occupying most of the site will serve as the base for the project, with retail uses occupying most of the first floor. Retail entrances are likely on all four elevations of the building, though the number and layout of individual tenants will determine the location of those entrances. Two apartment tower entry lobbies from University Avenue and N. Lake Street and a lobby for the University student services tower off Murray Mall are proposed. The second floor of the "base" building will include additional retail spaces on the University Avenue and Murray Mall sides, with a two-level parking facility occupying the southeastern corner of the floor.

The remainder of the parking for the development will be provided in a one-level underground facility that will occupy most of the building's basement, save for small mechanical rooms to be located in the southeastern corner. In total, the project will provide parking for 421 automobiles, with 259 spaces to be located in the underground parking level and 162 spaces to be located in the bi-level ramp located on the second floor of the building. The project also will provide 488 indoor bike parking spaces and 115 indoor moped parking spaces. Parking for an additional 28 mopeds will be provided off the southwest corner of the PUD on University land adjacent to East Campus Mall, which will be incorporated into the project during mall construction. Loop bicycle racks will also be incorporated into the streetscape improvements that will surround the site. The developer proposes to reserve some of the 421 parking stalls for tenants of the apartment tower,

with the remainder available for patrons of the retail spaces and University tower. A breakout of the parking to be allocated for the various uses should be included in a revised zoning text prior to recording. In addition, the applicant indicates that some of the 421 spaces may be made available for University special events primarily at the nearby Kohl Center.

An L-shaped loading dock and service area with entry from W. Johnson Street and N. Lake Street will extend through the southeastern quadrant of the first floor, with seven loading zones shown. A driveway from N. Lake Street adjacent to the N. Lake Street loading entrance will provide access to the lower parking level, while a driveway from W. Johnson Street will provide access to the second floor parking level. No interconnection between the two parking areas is proposed.

The first of two towers proposed will rise nine stories above the two-story base building (11-story total building height) and will contain approximately 236,500 square feet of space to be occupied by a number of UW student services. This tower will begin at the southwestern corner of the base building and extend above most of the W. Johnson Street façade of the building. Plans propose 62,000 square feet of space on the first two floors of the tower to be used as office space for various student activity organizations. The four middle floors of the tower totaling 97,000 square feet will be occupied by University Health Services, which will relocate from its current location at University Avenue and Breese Terrace. UW Student Services will occupy the top three floors, containing 71,000 square feet. Uses in this part of the tower will include Student Financial Services and the offices of the registrar and bursar. The tower will also contain 6,500 square feet of unspecified common space. The UW will own this tower following its completion under a condominium agreement the developer has arranged with the University.

The second tower will be a ten-story L-shaped building above the base building (12-story total building height) that will extend along the N. Lake Street and University Avenue elevations and contain 442,000 square feet of space with 350 dwelling units and 1,010 beds. The specific unit distribution calls for 20 one-bedroom units, 140 two-bedroom units, 50 three-bedroom units and 140 four-bedroom units. All of the units will contain living areas, kitchens and bathrooms; two-thirds of the units will have balconies. The applicant has submitted an apartment management plan for inclusion with the specific implementation plan. Highlights of the plan include professional onsite management of the apartment tower, electronically controlled entrances to the building and patio, and a move-in/ move-out plan that will include a schedule for tenants and will take advantage of the structured parking to control access during that period.

The height of the proposed University Square complex varies. The grade of the site falls modestly from the northwestern corner of the site towards the lower southeastern corner. The two-story retail/ parking "base" building will stand 35 feet above University Avenue and N. Lake Street and 40 feet above East Campus Mall and W. Johnson Street, with ten floors and a

mechanical penthouse above the base in the residential tower and nine stories above the base in the UW student services tower. In all, the residential tower will stand 150 feet above grade to the top of the mechanical penthouse, while the University tower will stand 160 feet above grade. Despite being one story taller, the residential tower will be shorter in actual height due to significantly higher floor-to-ceiling heights in the University tower (9 feet, 8 inches residential versus 13 feet, 4 inches in the UW tower). The project employs a modern design aesthetic with facades comprised primarily of precast concrete wall panels of different color and/or texture and an aluminum curtain wall system.

Both tenants of the 350-unit apartment tower and users of the University tower will have access to a rooftop plaza and garden to be located atop the two-story base building. Plans for the rooftop plaza and garden include a separate patio for the University tower overlooking East Campus Mall on the western end of the roof and a separate patio located near the inside corner of the residential tower for apartment tenants. Cedar shade structures will be constructed over portions of each patio. The remainder of the rooftop will be constructed with a patchwork of four different types of planting “trays” each containing a different array of plant materials.

The University Square redevelopment continues implementation of the University’s plans to convert the remaining sections of Murray Street between State Street and Regent Street into the non-vehicular East Campus Mall connecting Memorial Union and Red Gym on the north with the Kohl Center on the south. Most of the Lot 47 parking lot is located in the former right of way of the 300-block of N. Murray Street and will be replaced by the continuation of the mall, which is being constructed in segments typically coinciding with other University projects nearby. Plans call for the mall section between University Square and Vilas Communications Hall to feature a colonnade of canopy trees, combined with seating areas featuring cast stone pavers with built-in seating as part of planter seat walls and entry portals to accommodate outdoor eating restaurant use. Existing bicycle racks located along the western edge of the future mall will remain, while 28 moped parking spaces will be provided adjacent to the southwestern corner of the subject site opposite the entrance to the University tower (as discussed earlier in this report).

The redevelopment project also includes significant streetscape improvements to the rights of way of N. Lake Street, W. Johnson Street and University Avenue. Improvements proposed include the installation of raised planters along University Avenue and W. Johnson Street to both substantially enhance the streetscapes adjacent to the site and aid in correcting grade changes that occur along the project perimeter. The planters will include a variety of shade trees including elm, maple and honeylocust, with a mix of perennials, grasses and groundcovers to fill out the planters. Approval of these streetscape improvements in the right of way will require approval of the City Forester and the Real Estate Section as privileges in the public way.

Inclusionary Zoning: The University Square project is required by ordinance to provide 53 of the 350 dwelling units proposed as affordable under the inclusionary zoning program. However, the Community Development Block Grant office has determined that the project meets the criteria for a waiver from the Inclusionary Zoning provisions of the Zoning Ordinance as detailed in the attached report.

EVALUATION

The Planning Unit is very supportive of the applicant's efforts to redevelop University Square and believes that the proposal complies substantially with the demolition standards. The proposed development plan represents a significant and appropriate intensification of a currently underutilized site on a very significant downtown/ campus property. The condition of the existing commercial center is likely commensurate with buildings of its age and staff has no information that would indicate that the buildings are not structurally sound or capable of being rehabilitated or repaired. Staff believes that the proposed alternative use of the site will allow this property, located in an intensely developed commercial and institutional district, to continue to be economically productive for the foreseeable future. Staff also believes that the scale and massing of the new University Square complex will relate better to other existing buildings in the surrounding area. The new building would also appear to reflect the direction future buildings in the east campus area will take under the University's forthcoming Master Plan.

Conformance with Downtown Design Zone Standards

The consideration of the proposed redevelopment project must be reviewed against the criteria for a planned unit development in Downtown Design Zone 2. This zone is the most intensive of the four design zones and includes a number of large student-oriented residential developments that have been constructed primarily along University Avenue between Lake and Broom streets. The zone permits a maximum floor area ratio (FAR) of 6.0. FAR is a method used to measure the intensity of building coverage and land usage and equals the total floor area of a building divided by its lot area. The University Square development proposes a FAR of 5.58, based on 826,000 square feet of gross floor area on the 148,104 square-foot site (excluding parking by definition), therefore complying with the design zone requirement. The plan proposes a 15-foot front yard parallel to N. Lake Street, a 12-foot side yard along University Avenue, a 10-foot side yard along W. Johnson Street and a 25-foot rear yard along Murray Mall, all in compliance with the design zone standards. The yard spaces provided along University, Lake and Johnson will be incorporated into the streetscapes and sidewalks of those streets through the conveyance of pedestrian easements to the City to be accomplished by a Certified Survey Map.

Design Zone 2 restricts the heights of buildings to ten stories with the opportunity for two bonus stories to be approved if the project meets the additional design criteria. The criteria are intended

to allow for up to twelve-story buildings if the bonus “would result in a building design that makes an extraordinary contribution to the architecture of the area and the city as a whole.” The criteria encourage the bonus two stories to be stepped back and less massive than the lower floors, with the result being less boxy at the top in addition to meeting the other design criteria that relate to both the exterior and interior design elements of the building. The authority for granting the bonus stories is given to the Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission.

In reviewing the PUD-GDP for University Square, both the Urban Design Commission and Planning Unit expressed some hesitation based on the amount of information presented with that application, which consisted mainly of fairly general massing diagrams and perspective drawings. The Common Council approved the general development plan essentially approving the scale, massing, density, general building components and design while acknowledging that the specific implementation plan would address the remaining design issues. The elevations and perspective drawings submitted with the specific implementation plan, however, greatly expand upon the character of the proposed development. As noted in the project description, the project represents a modern design consisting of colored and textured precast concrete panels and an extensive aluminum curtain wall system. The facades of the two-story retail base of the complex will feature a number of both horizontal and vertical projections to add visual interest at the street level and reduce the mass of the building above. Though specifics of individual storefronts will be determined at the time tenants begin to occupy those spaces, the plans suggest a number of signage opportunities on canopies, marquees and along the walls of all four elevations.

The Planning Unit believes that the project meets the spirit of the planned unit development criteria including the standards for downtown design zones and the bonus-story provision. While the top two floors are not setback from the rest of the front façade, the design does succeed by incorporating façade elements that will reduce the building mass at the two stories nearest the street. Overall, staff feels the criteria for approval are met with this planned unit development and is very supportive of the project, which will result in a premier urban redevelopment project on an underutilized parcel in the City’s core. One revision staff would recommend, though, would be for the applicant to consider more substantial screens for the second-floor parking mezzanine that better match the curtain wall system and hide the presence of automobiles along the W. Johnson Street and N. Lake Street elevations.

Both towers will abide by the Capitol View height preservation ordinance, which restricts building height within a mile of the Capitol to a maximum of 187.2 feet above City datum.

The Urban Design Commission (UDC) reviewed the specific implementation plan and recommended **initial** approval of the project at its January 25, 2006 meeting and **final** approval on February 22, 2006 (see attached reports). In general, the UDC felt that the Downtown Design

ID #02871
University Square
March 6, 2006
Page 9

criteria were met with this project and recommended approval, save for signage and site lighting, which the UDC asked come back before them before construction begins on those facets.

Conformance with City Plans

As noted above, the Comprehensive Plan also identifies this site as a future transit-oriented development. While many of the proposed standards for transit-oriented developments contained in the plan pertain to more horizontal developments spread across larger tracts of land, a number of standards apply to the University Square redevelopment. Among the facets of transit-oriented developments present in this project include the variety of land uses proposed (housing, retail, institutional, etc.), the placement of the building to create a sense of street spatial enclosure, creation of a high-quality public realm along the perimeter streets and East Campus Mall and the inclusion of uses that generate pedestrian activity, such as retail, services and offices at the ground floor. The site is located along a heavily traveled transit corridor that operates along University Avenue and W. Johnson Street.

CONCLUSION

In reviewing the standards for planned unit developments, the Planning Unit believes the criteria are met with this redevelopment project, which should result in substantial benefits to the built environment that embody the intent of planned unit developments. In particular, that the proposed planned unit development is “compatible with the physical nature of the site or area” and “would produce an attractive environment of sustained aesthetic desirability, economic stability and functional practicality compatible with the [master] plan.” Staff believes that the redevelopment represents a building mass that should be significantly more in keeping with its physical surroundings than the existing building. The project should result in a substantial benefit to the City of Madison and the University of Wisconsin campus, providing a centralized location for student services, a retail anchor for the eastern end of campus with the potential to attract a variety of commercial and service opportunities, and additional new high-density housing for the western downtown and east campus area.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning Unit recommends that the Plan Commission forward Zoning Map Amendment 3163, rezoning One University Square (the 700-block of University Avenue) from Planned Unit Development, General Development Plan/ Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP) to Amended PUD-GDP-SIP to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**, subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

1. Comments from reviewing agencies.
2. That the plan materials be revised per Planning Unit approval as follows:
 - a.) revise the rooftop plaza and garden plan to include a typical list of planting

- materials to be included in the four rooftop planting trays;
- b.) revise the residential floorplans to include the number of units by bedroom type;
 - c.) include the final building material colors on the elevation sheets;
3. That the zoning text be revised per Planning Unit approval as follows:
 - a.) a breakout of the parking to be allocated for the various uses shall be included in a revised zoning text;
 - b.) replace the current family definition with a family definition related to R6 zoning;
 - c.) permitted uses shall be revised to state:
 - residential uses as permitted in the R6 zoning district
 - institutional uses
 - commercial uses as permitted in the C2 zoning district
 - uses accessory to those listed above, including outdoor eating areas not in the public right of way;
 - d.) the floor area ratio for the project shall be “as shown on the attached plans” and the references to maximum building height shall be removed;
 - e.) the statement of purpose should also reference the inclusion of the University tower.
 4. That the N. Lake Street and W. Johnson Street elevations be revised to include more substantial screen walls for the second-floor parking mezzanine that better match the curtain wall system of the rest of the building and more fully hide the presence of parked automobiles from those streets.
 5. That the applicant submit building elevations and any other relevant materials to the Planning Unit for approval of the exterior finishes of individual tenant spaces for first and second-floor retail spaces. Such plans shall include contextual information showing the relationship between the exterior finishes proposed and the remainder of the retail corridor.
 6. That the applicant submit a Certified Survey Map to the City of Madison for approval prior to recording the Amended PUD-GDP-SIP that dedicates the pedestrian easements to serve this development.
 7. That all improvements in the public right of way be subject to the approval of a Privilege in Streets approval or any other necessary approvals required from the Real Estate Section of the Community & Economic Development Unit, the City Forester and/ or Common Council. The design of the planters and other landscape materials in the public right of way shall be approved following a recommendation from the Planning Unit.

ID #02871
University Square
March 6, 2006
Page 12

8. That the applicant submit a Reuse and Recycling Plan for approval by the City of Madison Recycling Coordinator prior to the permits for demolition being issued.
9. That all portions of the building shall observe the Capitol View Preservation limits of 187.2 feet, City datum.