

AGENDA # 12

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: May 19, 2010

TITLE: 431 West Dayton Street – PUD(GDP-SIP),
Building Demolition for a Four-Unit
Apartment Building. 4th Ald. Dist. (18248)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: May 19, 2010

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Mark Smith, Bruce Woods and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 19, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 431 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Ferch and Dan Bohl, representing 431 West Dayton Street, LLC; Scott Kolar, representing Mifflin West District, CNI; and Dennis Grosse. Bohl presented plans for demolition of a building and construction of a four-unit apartment building. The project will incorporate brick and limestone accents and have the visual appearance of a three-story building. The building setbacks are consistent with the neighborhood. The project includes 21 bicycle parking stalls and 2 moped parking stalls, 3 of which are interior, 5 are covered. Screening is provided for the HVAC units, with enclosed garbage and a small greenspace for the residents. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- You should have more windows on east elevation. Natural light into the stairwells would be beneficial. You could introduce two windows in some of the bedrooms.
- Doesn't fit the neighborhood. Seems out of place. Wish this was something a bit fresher. Pseudo-historical.
- I can't hardly stand to look at what's down there. Abysmal area. Not sure it fits in with what's down there, but at the same time why not try something new.
- Consider balconies on the backside of the building.
- Landscaping should fit whatever architectural style the building ends up being.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Wagner, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-0). The motion for initial approval was for massing and building location, not architecture. The motion instructed the applicant to further examine expressions of building style, explore the architecture in a modern way, along with use of contemporary materials and to provide bike/moped parking at one stall per bedroom.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 431 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	3	-	-	-	5	-
	5	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	5	5	5	-	-	6	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Reconsider architectural style/era.
- Context good, architecture tired.

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: June 30, 2010

TITLE: 431 West Dayton Street – PUD(GDP-SIP),
for a New Four-Unit Apartment Building.
4th Ald. Dist. (18248)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: June 30, 2010

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, R. Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 30, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a new four-unit apartment building located at 431 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Ferch and Dan Bohl, representing 431 West Dayton, LLC; and Scott Kolar, representing CNI, Mifflin West District. Ferch presented site plan details. In order to accommodate the required amount of bicycle parking (16) they have added a covered stack rack system, along with the six covered under the decks. The laundry in the building has been moved into each unit, leaving them with six interior bicycle parking stalls. Landscaping has been added to conform with the type and architectural styling of the structure. Windows have been enlarged to provide cross ventilation in the front living rooms. Banding has been added to provide more of a sense of top and middle. A fourth story deck has been added to the fourth floor apartment. He stated they were asked to look at a different type of design, but they felt the original design fits in better with the neighborhood. He presented building materials and a lighting plan. Lighting levels and footcandles were discussed. Comments by the Commission were as follows:

- Ask your electrical engineer about code at ground level.
- Concern with the planting bed not leaving enough accessible room on the entrance walk. You need columnar evergreen in this planting area to give the windows year-round screening. Anything lower than 3-feet...
- You could do something more interesting with that walk by incorporating your building next door.
- On the northeast side where you have three layers, take out the spirea layer and make both sides symmetrical.
- Appreciate that you looked at other projects.
- This is another example of “if it’s always done the same,” you won’t progress in terms of thinking outside the box.
- _____ lights as opposed to muntins between the glass.
- Details of the style of railing and the pediment and the caps.
- The brick needs to be standard.
- The lighting should be metal halide.

- If you're going to do it, you've got to do it well.
- Applaud you on not cheapening with EIFS.
- It's kind of busy. I like the brownstone effort.
- Having a variety of window styles to this type of building is not unusual.
- You might want to change the proportions of the 4th floor muttons.
- The proportion of the dormer is pleasing.
- Looking at the fascia detail, it looks inappropriate to a building of this style.
- Maybe the keystone is a single piece as opposed to 3 pieces.
- The entryway needs some depth.

Scott Kolar spoke to the reaction of the neighborhood being more negative when presented with the more modern architecture.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Smith, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0). The motion provided for:

- Substantial landscaping between the buildings instead of a flower bed.
- No spirea, and not asymmetrical.
- The brick will match the sides of the building across the street.
- All of the windows on the front shall have a metal spacer between the glass and a muntin bar on the face.
- Details of the pediment for the top story and the entryway shall take into account suggestions for architectural treatment to come back to staff.
- The light levels shall meet City code with the option for the occupant to select a different walpac.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 431 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	5	5	-	5	6	5
	6	6	5	5	-	-	5	5
	5	6	5	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Good infill project. Busy collection of windows.
- Address alley space to the east – we appreciate the updated design, especially more windows.
- It's better than what exists currently on the site.
- If you are proposing an historic building it must be well done, down to the details.

Minutes, Mifflin West District Meeting on 6/9/10@ Central Library

Present: Scott Kolar, Peggy LeMehieu, Dory Christensen, Ruth Yarborough, Rick Broughman, Larry Warman, Brandon Cook, Pat Heiser, Alderman Michael Verveer and guests, Darryl & Wanda Malone

Meeting was called to order at 7:00PM by Chair Larry Warman. Minutes of May's meeting were approved.

The report from the District Development Oversight Steering Committee meetings was given by Scott Kolar. Members include Rick B, Dory C, Peggy L. and Brandon C. Consultant Peter Ostlind also attended.

1. 421 Dayton St. proposal by Dan Bohl was approved and a letter of approval was sent.

2. 416 W.Mifflin St. proposal by Gary Brink will be discussed 6/14/10

3. 450 W. Johnson St. proposal by Jeff Kramer will be scheduled for discussion when drawings of the project are received.

Darryl and Wanda Malone were present to discuss their proposal for a family style Puerto Rican restaurant called "Tropical Cuisine" to be opened at 15 N. Broom St. They are requesting a wine and beer license. The restaurant will be dine-in, carry-out and delivery. Proposed hours would be M-W 11AM to 12PM

Th- Sa 11AM to 2 or 3AM. Outdoor seating is planned on the sidewalk adjacent to the front door of the restaurant. The opening will be sometime in mid to late July. Seating capacity would be approx. 49 people with 10 tables inside and 3 to 4 tables outdoors. Darryl & Wanda plus their family members will run the establishment and Cliff Fisher's role is that of landlord only.

Requests from neighborhood members include taking the outside tables in late at night, be aware of noise problems late at night, check for adequate recycling and garbage space, close at 10Pm weekdays and 12 midnight on weekends and after midnight, do delivery only

Our neighborhood members would like to make rounds with the building inspectors in our area

The "Welcome" letter from Basset Neighborhood group was reviewed by Rick B. No information was in this letter to inform individuals who to call for help with building problems if the landlord is unresponsive. Rick proposed we have a similar letter but with telephone numbers and email address of people in the city to contact with problems. 266-4551 for the building inspector and cityofmadison.com with a link to "report a problem" was given to us by Alder. Mike Verveer.

Larry W. announced that the annual meeting of Capitol Neighborhoods Inc. will be 7PM 6/24/10 at Monona Terrace. The main speaker will be John Norquist and elections will be held for the executive committee.

Aldermans Report:

1. Michael Verveer encouraged people to attend the annual CNI meeting

2. When asked by a member he stated that Fred Mohs is considering a lawsuit regarding the Edgewater proposal. This would be a private suit and not a CNI suit.

3. Officers Chris Hill and Tony Fiore from the Madison Police Dept. will come to our monthly meetings if we desire, this was received with enthusiasm.

4. The planning staff recommendations for the Downtown Plan includes preserving the houses on the 400 and 500 blocks of Mifflin St. and demolition of all houses on the 400 and 500 blocks of W. Washington Ave. and the houses on W. Dayton, S. Main, W. Bedford, N. Broom and Bassett Streets. These would be replaced by six story buildings with a public alley to intersect the back yards. DMI supports this plan. A public meeting regarding this plan will be held on a Monday in July.

5. Next Tuesday the City Council will vote on a plan by the architects and Jeff Scher, a library expert, on the Central Library plan. A series of meetings will be held in the neighborhood regarding this plan. The first one is on August 5 @ 7PM in the Senior Center

The next 2 meetings will be held on Thursdays instead of Wednesdays because of the public music programs in the city. Larry W. will check with the library regarding space availability but tentatively the next two meetings will be 7/8/10 and 8/12/10 @ 7PM.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:50 PM

Submitted by Pat. Heiser