



exterior space, differing in size and elevation given the step down of the building and breaking down the scale on the residential fabric side of the building.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- I'm going to challenge you to rethink the arborvitae. Maybe you can combine some other grasses; the arborvitae may have this mass that doesn't enhance the building and the building isn't really going to be buffered by it. Play with grasses that will have more movement.
- Concrete 4'x4' squares would be more appropriate than stone steppers for this project, placed somewhat arbitrary, maybe with partial hedges. A stepper is too residential for the power of this building.
- I like the project. I would suggest, because of your strong geometric form, I would make the path more geometric. Canopy trees would help that hedge line and play with those linear bays of plant material.
- The building is so strong. It has its spirit, it's industrial in terms of materials, it's almost refining the angles of your landscape to reflect more of that industrial quality of the site and "toughen it up" a little bit. The motion implied in the architecture and followed up with the landscaping is wonderful.
- Is there any way to make the concrete pad smaller?
  - It's required for the hose movement so we need to provide a 20-foot wide condition that is hardscape that can handle a fire truck. The paving will be a mixture of colors and won't be just a broom finish concrete. The idea is to create a better texture in the plaza area.
  - The placement of the railroad corridor also dictates where the concrete pad is placed.

#### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by O'Kroley, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0). The motion required address of the above landscape comments.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7.5, 8, 9 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 636 West Wilson/633 & 639 West Doty Streets

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	-
	6	8	6	-	-	6	8	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9
	8	8	6.5	7	7	7	8	7.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9

General Comments:

- Outstanding character and motion to this building, true to the site. As you define landscape in the same dialog as the architecture, consider angle of accent bands —→ City. Grid or industrial grid? Treating loading/drop-off differently accentuates path to entry and not through site. Consider use of lighting/metal on the grand plane to continue the reflecting of the iron spot/metal.
- Great project.
- Excellent.
- Nice addition to this area.
- Orchid!

**AGENDA # 10**

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

<b>REPORT OF:</b> URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> December 21, 2011
<b>TITLE:</b> 636 West Wilson Street; 633 & 639 West Doty Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for West End Apartments, Five-Story Building with 60 Residential Units. 4 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (24852)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
<b>AUTHOR:</b> Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
<b>DATED:</b> December 21, 2011	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Dawn O’Kroley, Melissa Huggins and Richard Slayton.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of December 21, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 636 West Wilson Street; 633 and 639 West Doty Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Paul Cuta, Marc Shellpfeffer and Lance McGrath, all representing LT McGrath, LLC.

Grath noted that the project is called the West End Apartments which is a 60 unit rental building at the West Wilson Street dead-end on bike path. Bike parking will be provided in the building, in addition to a workstation in the lower level parking garage which also includes racks for bike hanging. They will be back early part of next year and occupancy in 2013. Five stories in residential use. Cuta noted that the site presents an interesting view down the corridor, pinches at midblock and opens further back with frontage on Wilson Street. The sixty-four wide building fronts the rail corridor. An entry plaza will provide for police and fire access as well as access to two levels of parking, one below and one at grade. The facility will hold 90 bike parking stalls within the 2 levels of parking. There will be a masonry base on the long building with a series of larger bays and cement floor and lap siding pulled out. A focus is the orange red color for entry. There will be a fitness and community room. Above the second floor there is an extended terrace. Insets of the balconies create a series of dark shadows and the interplay of the metal, the masonry and cement boarding. There will be 60 units on four floors. There is a slight variation in the units. The window fenestration is different in the units. Security lighting and landscaping is provided along the bike path. Thin slot windows extend all the way down to the parking level to give some light and some landscaping as well. Warm iron kind of brick will offer variety from rest of neighborhood.

Comments by the Commission were as follows:

- Liked the power of orange/red materials.
- Question the stair placement on corner near bike path.
- Not much green space. There are balconies. Utilize space. Maybe 400 or 500 square foot green roof on top, provide elevator or stairs to the roof. Liked orange and dark brick.

- Wondered about putting the light piece on bottom and darker on top. Would give appearance of floating.
- Secure bike parking. Storage units are to be installed with a space for bike in front. Consider providing a bike wash station?
- Lower massing on lower end is nice and brings life to the building. The open space is not fussy.
- Great opportunity with housing along the bike path.
- Warm colors.
- Question the metal panels shaking if and when there are more trains coming through. Maybe add glazing on windows also.

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project is 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 636 West Wilson Street; 633 & 639 West Doty Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	6	7	-	-	-	6	8	7

**General Comments:**

- Beautiful tribute to history of the neighborhood in a contemporary uncompromised design.
- Great start.