



Report to the Plan Commission

November 2, 2009

Legistar I.D. #16006

1246-1252 Williamson St. & 308-310 S. Baldwin St.

Demolition and Rezoning

Report Prepared By:
Heather Stouder, AICP
Planning Division Staff

Requested Action: Approval of the demolition of buildings at 310 S. Baldwin and 1252 Williamson Street and a rezoning of property from C2 (General Commercial) and R4 (General Residence) Districts to PUD-SIP (Planned Unit Development-Specific Implementation Plan) to construct a mixed-use building with 31 residential units and ground floor commercial space.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 28.12(12) provides the requirements for demolition requests. Section 28.12 (9) provides the process for zoning map amendments. Section 28.07 (6) of the Zoning Ordinance provides the requirements and framework for Planned Unit Development Districts.

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolitions, zoning map amendments, and planned unit developments can be met and forward the request to the November 17 meeting of the Common Council with a recommendation for **approval** to rezone 1246-1252 Williamson Street and 308-310 South Baldwin Street from C2 and R4 to PUD-SIP, subject to input at the public hearing and conditions from reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Applicant/Property Owner: Scott Lewis; CMI Management; 106 E. Doty St.; Madison, WI

Project Contact: J. Randy Bruce; Knothe & Bruce Architects, LLC; 7601 University Ave Ste 201, Middleton

Proposal: The applicant proposes the demolition of two principal buildings and a rezoning of four lots from C2 (General Commercial) and R4 (General Residence) to PUD-SIP (Planned Unit Development-Specific Implementation Plan) in order to build a three-story mixed-use building with 2,400 square feet of first floor commercial space, 31 apartments, and underground parking. The applicant hopes to begin work in fall 2009 after all approvals are obtained, and complete the building for August 2010 occupancy.

Parcel Location: At the northwest corner of Williamson and Baldwin Streets, the four existing parcels comprise .56 acres total; Aldermanic District 6 (Rummel); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions: 308 and 310 S. Baldwin Street each have a single-family home in the R4 (General Residence) District. 1246 and 1252 Williamson Street are zoned C2 (General Commercial), and lie within the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District. There is an existing two-family home at 1246 Williamson Street, and a vacant fuel station and gravel parking lot at 1252 Williamson Street.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: At the corner of Baldwin St. and Wilson St., a two-unit residential building in the R4 District.

South: Across Williamson St., commercial uses including Star Pharmacy, a small office building, the Willy St Co-op. and St. Vincent DePaul thrift store in the C2 District.

East: Across Baldwin Street, the Crystal Corner Bar, a small business office, and 1, 2, and 3-unit residential buildings in the C2 District.

West: Two 2-unit residential buildings immediately adjacent to the site along Williamson St., with commercial and office uses further to the west, all in the C2 District.

Adopted Land Use Plans: The Comprehensive Plan (2006) recommends Neighborhood Mixed Use for this parcel and the surrounding portion of the Williamson Street corridor. The Marquette Neighborhood Center Master Plan (2000- *see attached excerpts for reference*) recommends a mixed-use building for the redevelopment of this site, matching the urban character of the other three corners. The Plan suggests a mix of underground and surface parking, and offers that an aggregation of parcels might better provide an opportunity for the redevelopment. Design recommendations in the Plan are for a two to three-story building built at or close to the front property line.

Environmental Corridor Status: This property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: The area is served by a range of basic urban services and Metro Transit.

Zoning Summary:

Bulk Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area	Lot 1- 2000 sq. ft. Lot 2- 68,500 sq. ft. Lot 3- 2600 sq. ft.	Lot 1- 3,272 sq. ft. Lot 2- 18,174 sq. ft. Lot 3- 2,560 sq. ft.
Lot width	Lot 1- 50' Lot 2- 50' Lot 3- 50'	Lot 1- 33.1' Lot 2- 98.79' Lot 3- 32.99'
Usable Open Space	Lot 1- 500 sq. ft. Lot 2- 5,600 sq. ft. Lot 3- 640 sq. ft.	Lot 1- not specified Lot 2- not specified Lot 3- not specified (see condition No. 23, p. 11)
Front yard	Lot 1- 25' Lot 2- 0' Lot 3- 25'	Lot 1- 16.8' Lot 2- 2' Lot 3- not specified
Side yards	Lot 1- 6' each side Lot 2- 6'/ 15' total Lot 3- 6'/ 15' total	Lot 1- 3.9' RS / 3.1' LS Lot 2- 0 Lot 3- 1.4' RS / 5.9' LS
Rear yard	Lot 1- 35' Lot 2- 30' Lot 3- 30'	Lot 1- not specified Lot 2- 40' Lot 3- not specified
Floor area ratio	Lot 2	1.17
Building height	3 stories/40'	3 stories/ 39' - 43'

Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	34 or 1/ dwelling unit <u>8 for retail space</u> 42 total	24 garage <u>8 surface</u> 32 total
Accessible Stalls	1	1 (see condition No. 19, p. 11)
Loading	1(10' x 35') area	1
Number Bike Parking Stalls	36	31 (see condition No. 20, p. 11)
Landscaping	No	
Lighting	Yes	(see condition No. 21, p. 11)

Other Critical Zoning Items	
Urban Design	Yes
Historic District	Yes- Partially located within the Third Lake Ridge Historic District
Landmark Building	No
Floodplain	No
Utility Easements	Yes
Waterfront Development	No
Adjacent to Park	No
Barrier Free (ILHR 69)	Yes

Compiled by Pat Anderson, Assistance Zoning Administrator

*Since this property is being rezoned as a planned unit development (PUD), and there are no predetermined bulk requirements, it is reviewed based on the criteria for the C2 & R4 districts because of the surrounding land uses. With the Zoning conditions outlined at the end of this report, the proposed project **does** comply with all of the above requirements.

Project Description

The applicant is proposing the combination and rezoning of four existing lots at the corner of Williamson St. and Baldwin St. to facilitate a mixed-use redevelopment on a total of 0.56 acres (24,350 sq. ft.). As proposed, a vacant fuel station building at 1252 Williamson St. and a single-family home at 310 S Baldwin St. would be demolished in order to construct a mixed-use building with 2,400 square feet of ground floor commercial space, 31 apartment units, and a mix of under-building and surface parking. An existing two-family home at 1246 Williamson St. and an existing single-family home at 308 S Baldwin St. would remain, and portions of these parcels would be utilized for open space, stormwater management, bicycle parking, and a snow removal area common to the entire property.

Existing Conditions

The vacant building at 1252 Williamson St. is a one-story brick building constructed in 1955, and sits in the rear portion of the lot, along with a smaller brick accessory structure. Formerly a fuel station, the property has a history of pollution from petroleum products stored underground, but was ruled clean by the Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources in 2004. An existing gravel parking lot extends to both the eastern and southern property lines, and serves as the one “void” at this intersection surrounded by otherwise developed properties.

The single-family home at 310 S Baldwin St. proposed for demolition was constructed in 1894, and is in relatively poor condition. The 720 square foot, two-bedroom home is currently valued at under \$120,000, and appears to be in a condition that would preclude cost-effective repair or relocation. The single-family home further to the north at 308 S Baldwin St. was constructed in 1901, and is in much better condition. Currently valued at over \$225,000 the home has 3 bedrooms and over 1,300 square feet of livable area. A shared narrow gravel driveway between 308 and 310 S Baldwin St. is proposed for removal. The two-family home located at 1246 Williamson Street was constructed in 1909 and is also in good condition. As proposed, the two two-bedroom units in this building would remain, and the rear yard would be utilized for a new rain garden and usable open space for the entire property.

Proposed Land Use

The proposed lot reconfiguration results in three lots. On Lot 1, at 308 South Baldwin St., the existing single family house would remain. Lot 2 would include a new mixed-use building that is the focus of the proposal and review. Lot 3, 1246 Williamson St., would maintain an existing two-family home, but would lose much of its existing back yard to be utilized for stormwater management and open space for Lot 2.

The proposed mixed-use development on Lot 2 includes 31 units, the vast majority of which are one-bedroom apartments. The latest floor plans (dated October 27, 2009) for the new building include 4 efficiencies, 22 one-bedroom units, and 5 two-bedroom units. The overall residential density of the 34-unit proposal, when accounting for the two remaining homes, is approximately 62 units per acre and 78 bedrooms per acre. The essence of the project, the new mixed-use building, has a density of 81 units per acre and 94 bedrooms per acre.

2,572 square feet of ground floor commercial space is proposed for the entirety of the south side of the building along Williamson St., wrapping around the Baldwin St. corner before transitioning to residential units.

Site and Building Design

The proposed three-story building on Lot 2 has a gross floor area of 28,205 square feet and a footprint of approximately 9,400 square feet. Placed 2 ft from the property line along Williamson Street to the south and 2 ft. from the property line along Baldwin St. to the east, with a chamfered corner entry, the building frames this corner and provides a new pedestrian-oriented, active streetscape for those walking along Williamson Street and/or entering this commercial node from the north.

Parking- The site includes a total of 32 automobile parking stalls, 24 in an under-building parking area for residential use, and eight in a small surface lot behind the building for use by visitors to the commercial spaces or residents. 35 bicycle parking stalls are proposed, with a similar ratio of 25 within the underground parking area and 10 outdoor stalls.

Open Space and Stormwater Management- For stormwater management, the site plan includes a rain garden approximately 15 by 40 feet in what is now the back yard of the two-family home at 1246 Williamson Street to the west. Usable open space calculations provided by the applicant suggest that Lot 1 maintains 970 square feet, Lot 2 (location of the new building) has 3,500 square feet, and Lot 3 would have 650 square feet. (The usable open space calculation for Lot 2 is significantly inflated, as it currently includes the areas programmed for formal landscaping and the rain garden).

A rounded courtyard patio proposed off of the northwest portion of the building would be the most likely common space actually used by residents of the new building. The elevations include small balconies for ten of the units, which would provide additional private open space for some of the residents. The small patio with a terrace off of the southwest corner of the new building is intended for uses accessory to the future commercial space.

Entries and Openings- The rhythm of openings complements surrounding buildings, as well as others in the Williamson Street corridor. The main entrance on the chamfered corner complements the entrance to the Crystal Corner Bar across the street, and the three double doors along Williamson Street provide for a total of four separate commercial entrances. Three additional entrances, including an accessible entrance on Baldwin Street and two smaller entrances on the western side of the building lead into the shared hallway for the residential portion of the building. The north side of the building includes the vehicle access door to the under-building parking as well as another utility entrance which would be used for trash removal.

A row of large windows into the commercial spaces along the Williamson Street frontage continue around the corner along Baldwin Street and terminate at the residential entrance. Along the rest of the Baldwin Street portion of the building, windows are appropriately located higher, so that passers by will not be looking directly into residential spaces. Several, although not all, of the units include small balconies accessed through sliding glass doors, although these are omitted from the Williamson Street side of the building.

Exterior Materials- The exterior of the building includes a mix of historic and contemporary materials. The building, and especially the main portion of its mass on the corner, is dominated by a brick veneer with pre-cast bands and window sills. Portions of the building include steel and wood panels, aluminum, and cantilevered bays comprised of painted hardi-plank. As the elevation slopes down moving northward along Baldwin Street, the under-building parking area is exposed as a renaissance stone base.

Window Bays- Throughout the design evolution, the form of the projecting window bays has been revised several times, responding to input from the Marquette Neighborhood Association, the Urban Design Commission and staff. Early studies of the elevations included several cantilevered window bays, including the main corner of the building and some of the bays along Williamson Street. The plans officially submitted on September 2 with the rezoning request omitted all cantilevered bays and replaced them with traditional perpendicular bays, projecting uniformly from the building from top to bottom. The most recent iteration of the elevations (*dated October 27, 2009*) incorporates a total of four sets of cantilevered window bays with a hardi-plank face. Two project from the Baldwin Street side of the building, one from the rear toward the parking lot, and the other on the western side of the building near the rear. All projections on the Williamson Street elevation are traditional perpendicular projections, and the corner element has returned to a design much closer to other similar buildings within the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Landscaping- As mentioned above, a large rain garden with over 400 native plants is proposed in the northwest portion of the lot for stormwater management. The landscape plan also includes foundation plantings along the western and eastern (Baldwin Street) side of the building, and screening around the perimeter of the small surface parking lot. Aside from the rain garden plantings, a total of six trees, 30 shrubs, and over 200 low plantings are distributed throughout the site.

Evaluation

Land Use

Commercial Uses- The proposed building is essentially residential, but the meaningful commercial element would greatly improve the pedestrian environment along Williamson Street. At 2,572 square feet, the ground floor commercial space occupies less than 10% of the gross floor area of the building, yet provides an adaptable space or group of spaces suitable for a range of one to four tenants. Specific commercial uses in the proposed zoning text link this commercial space to the existing C2 (General Commercial) and O-1 (Limited Office – Residence) Districts. Since the zoning code is currently being rewritten and these districts will soon be irrelevant, staff recommends that prior to staff sign-off, the applicant submit a revised zoning text to include a list of specific uses permitted within the commercial portion of the building.

Residential Unit Mix- The residential portion of the building is overwhelmingly one-bedroom apartments ranging in size from 433 to 757 square feet. 5 of the 31 units have two bedrooms, and range in size from 894 to 956 square feet. The predominance of efficiencies and one-bedroom units significantly limits the types of households that will likely choose to live in the building. While this configuration may respond to the current market and fill an important niche within this neighborhood, it seems inconsistent with the general desire to accommodate a variety of household types in new residential development. Among its top five housing recommendations, the Marquette-Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Plan (1994) includes the following with regard to new residential developments:

“...To meet the special needs of the diverse low and moderate population, apartment units with three or more bedrooms for larger families and barrier free design for elderly and/or handicapped population should be part of the development.”

While this location may not be ideal for apartments with three or more bedrooms, staff strongly encouraged the applicant to consider incorporating more two-bedroom units within the building to allow for a greater array of household types. Originally proposed with only 4 two-bedroom units, the latest revision to the plans reflects an additional two-bedroom unit on the first floor, replacing a unit formerly configured as a “one-bedroom plus den”. The applicant has indicated that further changes to incorporate different unit types are not feasible (*see attached email dated October 28*).

*Consistency with Adopted Plans-*The mixed-use project is a good example of development appropriate for the Neighborhood Mixed-Use (NMU) areas as recommended in the Comprehensive Plan (2006). Within NMU areas, the Plan calls for well-designed buildings between two and four stories in height, placed close to the sidewalk and street, with parking located underground or behind the building.

The project very closely matches a highly specific site redevelopment recommendation in the Marquette Neighborhood Center Master Plan (2000), which was Phase 1 of the Williamson Street B.U.I.L.D. Plan focused on the 1100, 1200, and 1300 blocks of Williamson Street. Primary Recommendation No. 3 in the Plan reads as follows:

“Redevelop the northwest corner of Baldwin and Williamson (vacant Sunrise Oil Company) and adjacent lands) as a mixed use building utilizing underground parking and surface parking at the rear. The new building should be placed at the sidewalk and its architectural detailing should match the urban character of buildings such as the Schaefer Pharmacy.

As recommended in the Plan, the proposed redevelopment is a mixed-use building with residential units above commercial spaces and underground parking. The proximity of the building to the front property line follows plan recommendations and is consistent with other buildings on this corner. The only possible divergence from the Plan is that the building proposed is three, rather than the two stories recommended on p. 21 (*see attached excerpt*), and would thus be the tallest among the buildings on this particular corner. However, the map and illustrations on pages 33 and 35 of the Plan would allow for up to three stories at this location. In any case, Planning Division staff believes that the height of the proposed mixed-use building demonstrates consistency with the intent of the Plan, and is appropriate at this location.

Demolition-The demolition of the former fuel station at 1252 Williamson Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District was granted a Certificate of Appropriateness by the Landmarks Commission. Demolition of the single-family home at 310 S Baldwin St. seems appropriate, given the condition of the structure and the consistency of the proposed redevelopment with adopted plans. In fact, the demolition is consistent with one of the primary recommendations in the Marquette Neighborhood Center Master Plan (*see p. iii in attached excerpt*) reads:

"Take advantage of future redevelopment opportunities within the target area to increase density and consolidate land uses. In some cases, buildings that have outlived their structural usefulness should be demolished so that newly constructed projects can contribute to a denser urban design..."

So long as the applicant can demonstrate that the implementation of the proposal will proceed in a timely manner, the Planning Division supports the demolition of these buildings. Staff recommends that the applicant be required to show proof of ownership of all parcels, as well as proof of financing for the proposal prior to acquiring demolition permits for 310 S Baldwin Street or 1252 Williamson Street.

Interface with Potential Neighborhood Conservation District- While the heart of this proposal is right at the corner of Williamson and Baldwin Streets, the existing single-family home at 310 South Baldwin Street proposed for demolition lies just within an area currently being studied as a potential Neighborhood Conservation District (NCD). The NCD has not yet been created, nor have the boundaries been delineated, but at this time, staff believes that demolition of this home would not significantly affect the NCD study process or the substance of the potential NCD itself. The study area is focused on the frontage along Wilson Street, Schley Pass, and Dewey Court. In fact, this parcel could potentially be excluded from the NCD or considered as a "transition parcel" between the NCD and Williamson Street. Further, the inclusion of property at 308 S Baldwin into the proposed Planned Unit Development helps to protect the existing residential building as a transition between this relatively intense development on the corner and properties with less intense development to the north.

Site and Building Design

Stormwater Management- Based on comments from City Engineering, it is clear that stormwater management details still need to be addressed for this project. Currently, the proposed development would rely primarily on a large rain garden for infiltration of runoff from the roof and surface parking area. While a well-maintained rain garden, will certainly be an asset, it may not be sufficient, especially during heavy rains. Staff is aware that early discussions with the neighborhood representatives included possibilities for a green roof, which would absorb additional stormwater, especially during light rains. While not shown on submitted plans, a green roof for this function may be an asset to the project, and its incorporation could be further explored. In addition, pervious paving could be explored for portions of the surface parking lot. Prior to staff signoff and recording of the PUD, Planning Division staff would like for the applicant to provide an explanation of the technical, structural, and economic feasibility of incorporating pervious pavement and a green roof (upon initial construction or in the future) within the project. To the extent that they are feasible, these elements are strongly encouraged.

Usable Open Space- In an area well-served by public open spaces (Orton Park, a future Central Park, and the Capital City Trail), the relatively small amount of on-site usable open space seems to be sufficient. The intended use of open space is separate by lot, meaning that no cross access easements would be provided so as to allow for common use. Residents of the house on Lot 1 would have access to the entire backyard, similar to the existing condition today. Residents of the house on Lot 3 would have a much smaller backyard than the existing condition. Residents in the new building would have very little usable open space on-site. While the applicant indicated that 3,500 square feet of open space would be available for these residents, the vast majority of it is actually "programmed" as formal landscaping and the rain garden feature. Still, the small rounded patio will provide spaces for small groups of residents and visitors to gather, sit, and perhaps enjoy meals, and the small balconies provide additional amenities for some of the residents. There are currently inconsistencies between elevations and floor plans submitted with regard to the exact location and size of the balconies. The applicant indicates that the elevations are correct, and has agreed to ensure consistency in the final plan set for staff review.

While it may be desirable in a planned unit development to ensure that the design and availability of open space is *common* to all residents, staff does not feel that this is necessary, so long as all residents can indeed access high-quality usable open space within the project. So as to reduce confusion on this issue in the future (especially if Lots 1 and 3 were to be sold to a new owner), staff recommends that the applicant clarify the intended use for these spaces in a revised zoning text, as well as in future leases for residential tenants.

While not explicitly intended as such, the patio adjacent to the commercial space on the southwest corner of the building would be a good location for a small outdoor eating area, which would be permitted according to the proposed zoning text. Since this patio is very close to the two-family home at 1246 Williamson Street, staff recommends that limitations on noise and hours of operation typically covered in the conditional use approval be incorporated directly into the revised zoning text. Specifically, the text should specify that any amplified sound and/or hours of operation after 10:00pm in for this space would require conditional use review and approval by the Plan Commission.

Parking- The proposed amount and distribution of parking for 31 new residential units and 2,500 square feet of commercial space appears to be adequate, especially in an area so well-served by infrastructure to support transit, bicycling, and walking (as well as the on-street parking available nearby). As indicated in the Zoning conditions, one additional bicycle stall will be required to bring the total to 36 stalls. The under-building parking area and small surface lot should meet the needs of residents, employees, and visitors, although it is unclear in submitted plans which of these parties will have access to parking areas and when. Staff recommends that final plans submitted include a more detailed management plan for the parking area, both outdoor and under-building, to include spaces reserved for residents, commercial employees, as well as any spaces available to residents of the building at 308 S Baldwin Street.

Building Exterior- The building articulation, openings, and exterior materials complement the historic qualities of the neighborhood while introducing unique, contemporary features such as steel paneling and cantilevered window bays. Detailed design elements have been thoroughly vetted by neighborhood representatives and the Urban Design Commission, which recommended Final Approval for the project on October 22, 2009. While the Urban Design Commission noted a desire to see cantilevered window bays on the Williamson Street elevation of the building, Planning Division staff feels that the compromise achieved in the most recent version of the elevations is optimal.

Landscaping- The proposal includes attractive and varied plantings along Baldwin Street, with emphasis on screening the small surface lot and plantings along the base of the building to screen the under-building parking area as it emerges due to the slope of the site. The southern side of the building along Williamson Street is appropriately left without plantings, as the sidewalk will be reconstructed to abut the building directly. The western side of the building and parking lot are well screened with shrubs

and low plantings, and the plantings proposed for the rain garden include a vibrant mix of native, water-loving sedges, grasses, and perennial flowers. The Urban Design Commission has carefully reviewed the landscape plan since the initial submittal, and granted Final Approval when their suggestions and conditions were reflected in the most recent iteration of the plans.

Incorporation of 308 S Baldwin Street and 1246 Williamson Street – Although Lots 1 and 3, flanking the new building, would remain separate lots, they would be incorporated into the Planned Unit Development as proposed. However, specific design changes to the homes, which would be typical in any planned unit development, have not yet been submitted. At the suggestion of the Urban Design Commission, the applicant has agreed to reintroduce bay windows on the front façade of the two-family house at 1246 Williamson Street (new window openings are shown in the October 27 plans). Aside from this, the applicant has expressed a desire to make small interior and exterior improvements in the future, but would need to more thoroughly explore the homes in order to better detail the plans. Staff recommends that the applicant be required to provide in final plans for staff review further detail on these bay windows, as well as any further plans for interior and exterior changes to the existing homes.

Prior to recording the PUD, the applicant should also work with staff from Planning and Zoning to revise the zoning text to allow for ongoing maintenance and improvements to these properties without requiring alterations to the PUD. These allowable improvements should not include major additions or changes to the number of units in each building, but could include replacement of a roof, siding, and windows, as well as interior renovations. Since the home at 1246 Williamson Street lies within the Third Lake Ridge Historic District, all exterior changes would still require approval by the Landmarks Commission or Historic Preservation staff as appropriate.

Public Input

At the time of this report, there is no known opposition to the project. The applicant team met with neighbors on several occasions, both before and after submitting the application. An October 19 letter received on behalf of the Marquette Neighborhood Association Board of Directors (attached) summarizes the support of the neighborhood association, specifically mentioning appreciation of contemporary design done in such a way as to respect the historic context. Staff understands that the applicant was encouraged by the neighborhood association to include a greater proportion of contemporary design features, such as an angled cantilevered window bay on the prominent corner of the building, and a lesser proportion of brick in favor of other exterior materials. An October 28 e-mail from the Marquette Neighborhood Association President affirms continued support for the project, but alludes to some disappointment that some of the contemporary elements were removed prior to formal submittal and review.

Related Approvals

This proposal has been reviewed by the Urban Design Commission as a Planned Unit Development, and by the Landmarks Commission due to its location within the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Urban Design Commission

On September 16, 2009, the Urban Design Commission unanimously granted Initial Approval for the design of the project, providing in their motion direction for a redesigned rain garden, further study of the design feature on the southern corner of the building, small landscaping revisions, encouragement of canopy trees in the terrace along Baldwin Street, and the reincorporation of cantilevered bays along Williamson Street, which had been presented for informational purposes at an earlier meeting. Also discussed at the September 16 meeting was a desire to reincorporate bay windows on the façade of the house at 1246 Williamson Street, which the applicant agreed to do as part of the Planned Unit Development (*see attached report*).

On October 22, 2009, the Urban Design Commission unanimously recommended Final Approval for the design of the project, despite indicating that they would have liked to have seen the return of more cantilevered bays on the Williamson Street frontage. Satisfied with the reorientation of the rain garden, landscaping, and the proposed design feature over the small public plaza on the south side of the building, this motion included the two remaining conditions explained as follows:

- On the upper portion of the main corner element, the applicant will remove the projecting metal canopy and reincorporate an arched window head on the third floor.
- For all articulation and projections from the building, whether they are hardi-plank, brick, or another specified material, the same material shall be used to “return” the projection to the building. (For example, where brick façades project one foot from the steel panels building on the Williamson Street elevation, the same brick will be utilized on the sides of the projections to return back to the steel paneling. On the cantilevered bays projecting from the brick exterior on the Baldwin Street elevation, the same hardi-plank material used on the face of the bays will be used on the sides to return back to the brick.)

The report of the October 22 Urban Design Commission meeting was not complete at the time of this writing, but will be provided to the Plan Commission for reference at the November 2 meeting. In any case, the conditions from the UDC have been included as Conditions No. 12 and 13 recommended at the end of this report.

Landmarks Commission

On October 5, 2009, the Landmarks Commission granted two certificates of appropriateness for the proposal, one for the demolition of the fuel station building at 1252 Williamson Street, and one for the design of the new building. Importantly, the Landmarks Commission was reviewing an earlier version of the elevations that had perpendicular window bays, rather than the cantilevered bays preferred by the UDC and the Marquette Neighborhood Association (see discussion above). Since this design feature may have impacted their earlier decision, the Landmarks Commission will review the proposal for a second time on November 2, 2009, directly preceding the Plan Commission meeting, in order to review the most recent iteration. The Acting Historic Preservation Planner has recommended approval of the certificate of appropriateness (see *attached report dated October 28*), and staff does not foresee that the cantilevered bays would cause the reversal of the October 5 decision.

The Landmarks Commission finding will be reported to the Plan Commission for consideration during the public hearing portion of the November 2 Plan Commission meeting. Should it conflict with the recommendation by the Urban Design Commission with regard to the design of the window bays, Planning Division staff recommends that the Plan Commission take into account the mission and expertise of Landmarks Commission acting within local historic districts and make clear in an additional condition which version of window bays is being recommended for approval, if applicable.

Conclusion

The proposed land use associated with the requests for demolition and rezoning is generally consistent with the Comprehensive Plan (2006) and the adopted Marquette Neighborhood Center Master Plan (2000). The proposal replaces a highly underutilized property with a valuable mixed-use infill project, respectful, and even protective, of surrounding properties. Site and building design introduce contemporary features, while complementing surrounding properties in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. The proposed development will be a very positive addition to this neighborhood, providing high-quality rental housing opportunities and attractive commercial space, to enhance this already vibrant intersection. While the homogeneity of unit types within the building is not ideal, the development does provide a viable, high quality rental opportunity for those employed in or close to downtown or near transit routes, as well as individuals of all ages wishing to live close to a wide variety of neighborhood amenities.

The relationship among lots included in the proposed Planned Unit Development still needs clarification with regard to usable open space and parking, but Planning Division staff recognizes that their aggregation is necessary for the project as a whole to move forward due.

That there is no known opposition to the proposal is a strong testament to the genuine efforts by the applicant to provide opportunities for input by the Marquette Neighborhood Association and others. Overall, this proposal is a fine example of the implementation of plans which have received years of attention and hard work by citizens, staff, and elected officials. On a challenging property, the proposal sets a high bar for infill development in this area and across the City.

Should the Landmarks Commission grant the necessary certificates of appropriateness upon review of the revised design, the Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that standards for demolition approval and Planned Unit Developments can be met with this request, and forward this request to the November 17 meeting of the Common Council with a recommendation for **approval**.

Alternatively, should the Landmarks Commission refer or fail to grant certificates of appropriateness for the proposal, staff recommends that the Plan Commission **refer** the request to the November 16 Plan Commission meeting to allow time for more thorough review by staff and the Landmarks Commission, if applicable.

Recommendations and Proposed Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are shaded

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

If the Landmarks Commission grants the necessary certificates of appropriateness on November 2, 2009, the Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for zoning map amendments and planned unit developments can be met and forward the request to the November 17 meeting of the Common Council with a recommendation for **approval** to rezone 1246-1252 Williamson Street and 308-310 South Baldwin Street from C2 and R4 to PUD-SIP, subject to input at the public hearing, conditions submitted by reviewing agencies, and any conditions suggested by the Landmarks Commission on November 2, 2009.

Alternatively, should the Landmarks Commission refer or fail to grant certificates of appropriateness for the proposal, staff recommends that the Plan Commission **refer** the request to the November 16 Plan Commission meeting to allow time for more thorough review by staff and the Landmarks Commission, if applicable.

Planning Division (Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

1. A revised zoning text shall be prepared by the applicant and approved by staff to specify uses permitted in the commercial portion of the building, rather than referring to uses allowed in an existing zoning district.
2. Final floor plans for staff review and approval may include a greater number of units with more than one bedroom.
3. Prior to acquiring a demolition permit, the applicant shall provide proof of ownership of the four parcels involved in the proposal.
4. Prior to acquiring a demolition permit, the applicant shall provide proof of financing for the implementation of the project as proposed.

5. Final plans submitted for staff review shall include documentation on the structural and economic feasibility of incorporating a full or partial green roof and pervious pavers on all or part of the surface lot behind the building. Incorporation of these elements, upon construction or in the future, is highly encouraged where feasible.
6. Elevations and floor plans submitted by the applicant for final staff review and approval will be consistent generally, and specifically with regard to the size and location of residential balconies.
7. The applicant shall work with staff to revise the zoning text to include clarification on the intended use of open space on Lots 1, 2, and 3, and also provide a copy of residential leases outlining open space policies within the site.
8. The revised zoning text shall specify that any outdoor use accessory to the commercial space to include amplified sound or hours of operation later than 10:00 PM will require conditional use review and approval by the Plan Commission.
9. The applicant shall work with staff to revise the zoning text to include clarification on the intended use of parking areas and also provide a copy of residential leases outlining parking policies within the site. Any proposed signage for the parking areas shall be shown on final plans submitted for staff review and approval.
10. For review and approval by Planning, Historic Preservation, and Urban Design staff, the applicant shall include on final plans new bay windows on the home at 1246 Williamson Street and any other changes proposed to the existing homes.
11. Prior to recording the Planned Unit Development, the applicant shall work with staff to revise the zoning text to allow for ongoing maintenance and minor improvements to 308 South Baldwin Street and 1246 Williamson Street (due to its location in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District, all exterior changes to 1246 Williamson Street will continue to be subject to review and approval by Historic Preservation staff).
12. As recommended by the Urban Design Commission, the upper window of the main corner element will include an arched window head, and the projecting metal canopy will be omitted (*these changes are reflected in revisions dated October 27*).
13. As recommended by the Urban Design Commission, for all articulation and projections from the building, the material on the face of the projection shall be used to "return" the projection to the building.

14. No interior, exterior or structural demolition or wrecking activities or remodeling activities (including material reclamation activities by the applicant or a third party) shall commence nor any wrecking or building permits be issued until the applicant has met all of the conditions of approval stated in this letter.
15. Signage approvals are not granted by the Plan Commission. All future signage proposed must be reviewed for compliance with Chapter 31 of the Madison General Ordinances and Chapter 33 Urban Design District ordinances. Signage permits are issued by the Zoning Section of the Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

16. Provide a reuse/recycling plan, to be reviewed and approved by The City's Recycling Coordinator, Mr. George Dreckmann, prior to a demolition permit being issued.
17. Section 28.12(12)(e) of the Madison Zoning Ordinance requires the submittal of documentation demonstrating compliance with the approved reuse and recycling plan. Please note, the owner must submit documentation of recycling and reuse within 60 days of completion of demolition.

18. The final plans shall be consistent with the CSM that is in process also. The plans shall show all setbacks from proposed property lines for all three structures on the three proposed lots.
19. Meet all applicable State accessible requirements, including but not limited to:
 - a) Provide a minimum of one accessible stall striped per State requirements in the surface lot and one in the garage. A minimum of one of the stalls shall be a van accessible stall 8' wide with an 8' striped out area adjacent in the garage and in the surface lot.
 - b) Show signage at the head of the stalls.
 - c) Show the accessible path from the stalls to the building including ramps, curbs/wheel stops where needed to protect the path.
20. Provide 36 bike parking stalls in a safe and convenient location on an impervious surface to be shown on the final plan. (34 stalls for the residential component and 2 for the retail). The bike racks shall be securely anchored to the ground or building to prevent the racks from moving. NOTE: A bike-parking stall is two feet by six feet with a five-foot access area.
21. Lighting plans are required for this project. Provide a plan showing at least .25 footcandle on any surface of the lot and an average of .75 footcandles.
22. Provide floor plans and elevations of the two existing houses on proposed Lots 1 and 3.
23. Provide details of usable open space, show on plans, along with the calculations.

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Dailey, 261-9688)

- | |
|---|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none">24. Add the directional prefix of "South" to Baldwin Street on all necessary Certified Survey Map pages including the legal description.25. Correct the typographical error contained in the "Original" Plat reference on all necessary pages.26. Final approved addresses for resultant Lots 1, 2 and 3 will be available when the CSM is recorded and necessary for final plan submittals for approval. The final plan submittals for approval on this site shall be assigned per these approved addresses.27. Any damage to South Baldwin Street pavement will require restoration in accordance with the City's Patching Criteria.28. Storm calculations shall document how treating roof and not parking lot will allow the site to meet the 40% reduction in TSS compared to existing conditions. |
|---|
29. The construction of this building will require removal and replacement of sidewalk, curb and gutter and possibly other parts of the City's infrastructure. The applicant shall enter into a City / Developer agreement for the improvements required for this development. The applicant shall be required to provide deposits to cover City labor and materials and surety to cover the cost of construction. The applicant shall meet with the City Engineer to schedule the development of the plans and the agreement. The City Engineer will not sign off on this project without the agreement executed by the developer. The developer shall sign the Developer's Acknowledgement prior to the City Engineer signing off on this project.
 30. Submit a PDF of all floor plans to Lori Zenchenko addressing@cityofmadison.com so that a preliminary interior addressing plan can be developed. If there are any changes pertaining to the location of a unit, the deletion or addition of a unit, or to the location of the entrance into any unit, (before, during, or after construction) the addresses may need to be changed. The interior address plan is subject to the review and approval of the Fire Marshal.
 31. The applicant shall Dedicate a Permanent Limited Easement for a sidewalk 2 feet wide adjacent to Williamson Street as proposed on the on the site plan.

32. The value of the sidewalk installation exceeds \$5000. The applicant shall Construct Sidewalk to a plan approved by the City Engineer along Williamson Street.
33. The applicant shall close all abandoned driveways by replacing the curb in front of the driveways and restoring the terrace with grass.
34. All work in the public right-of-way shall be performed by a City licensed contractor.
35. The plan set shall be revised to show a proposed private internal drainage system on the site. This information shall include the depths and locations of structures and the type of pipe to be used.
36. The applicant shall demonstrate compliance with Section 37.07 and 37.08 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding permissible soil loss rates. The erosion control plan shall include Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) computations for the construction period. Measures shall be implemented in order to maintain a soil loss rate below 7.5-tons per acre per year.
37. The City of Madison is an approved agent of the Department of Commerce. This proposal contains a commercial building and as such, the City of Madison is authorized to review infiltration, stormwater management, and erosion control on behalf of the Department of Commerce. No separate submittal to Commerce or the WDNR is required.
38. Prior to approval, this project shall comply with Chapter 37 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding stormwater management. Specifically, this development is required to control 40% TSS (20 micron particle) off of new paved surfaces. Stormwater management plans shall be submitted and approved by City Engineering prior to signoff.
39. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, a digital CAD file (single file) to the Engineering Program Specialist in the Engineering Division (Lori Zenchenko). The digital CAD file shall be to scale and represent final construction. The single CAD file submittal can be either AutoCAD (dwg) Version 2001 or older, MicroStation (dgn) Version J or older, or Universal (dxf) format and contain only the following data, each on a separate layer name/level number:
 - a) Building Footprints
 - b) Internal Walkway Areas
 - c) Internal Site Parking Areas
 - d) Other Miscellaneous Impervious Areas (i.e. gravel, crushed stone, bituminous/asphalt, concrete, etc.)
 - e) Right-of-Way lines (public and private)
 - f) All Underlying Lot lines or parcel lines if unplatted
 - g) Lot numbers or the words "unplatted"
 - h) Lot/Plat dimensions
 - i) Street names

All other levels (contours, elevations, etc) are not to be included with this file submittal.

NOTE: Email file transmissions preferred izenchenko@cityofmadison.com . Include the site address in the subject line of this transmittal. Any changes or additions to the location of the building, sidewalks, parking/pavement during construction will require a new CAD file.

40. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, digital PDF files to the Engineering Division (Jeff Benedict or Tim Troester). The digital copies shall be to scale, and shall have a scale bar on the plan set.
- PDF submittals shall contain the following information:
- a) Building footprints.
 - b) Internal walkway areas.
 - c) Internal site parking areas.
 - d) Lot lines and right-of-way lines.
 - e) Street names.
 - f) Stormwater Management Facilities.
 - g) Detail drawings associated with Stormwater Management Facilities (including if applicable planting plans).
41. The applicant shall submit prior to plan sign-off, electronic copies of any Stormwater Management Files including:
- a) SLAMM DAT files.
 - b) RECARGA files.
 - c) TR-55/HYDROCAD/Etc
 - d) Sediment loading calculations
- If calculations are done by hand or are not available electronically the hand copies or printed output shall be scanned to a PDF file and provided.
42. The applicant shall obtain a Street Excavation permit for the installation of utilities required to serve this project. The applicant shall pay the permit fee, inspection fee and street degradation fee as applicable and shall comply with all the conditions of the permit.
43. The applicant shall obtain all necessary sewer connection permits and sewer plugging permits prior to any utility work.
44. The applicant's utility contractor shall obtain a connection permit and excavation permit prior to commencing the storm sewer construction.
45. Prior to approval of the conditional use application, the owner shall obtain a permit to plug each existing sanitary sewer lateral that serves a building that is proposed for demolition. For each lateral to be plugged the owner shall deposit \$1,000 with the City Engineer in two separate checks in the following amounts: (1). \$100 non-refundable deposit for the cost of inspection of the plugging by City staff; and (2). \$900 for the cost of City crews to perform the plugging. If the owner elects to complete the plugging of a lateral by private contractor and the plugging is inspected and approved by the City Engineer, the \$900 fee shall be refunded to the owner.
46. The site plan shall be revised to show all existing public sanitary sewer facilities in the project area as well as the size, invert elevation, and alignment of the proposed service.
47. Arrows shall be added to the certified survey map indicating the direction of drainage for each property line not fronting on a public street. In addition, the certified survey map shall include lot corner elevations, for all lot corners, to the nearest 0.25-foot. The following notes shall be added to the certified survey map.
- a) Arrows indicate the direction of surface drainage swale at individual property lines. Said drainage swale shall be graded with the construction of each principal structure and maintained by the lot owner unless modified with the approval of the City Engineer. Elevations given are for property corners at ground level and shall be maintained by the lot owner.
 - b) All lots within this certified survey are subject to public easements for drainage purposes which shall be a minimum of 6-feet in width measured from the property line to the interior of each lot except that the easements shall be 12-feet in width on the perimeter of the certified survey. For

purposes of two (2) or more lots combined for a single development site, or where two (2) or more lots have a shared driveway agreement, the public easement for drainage purposes shall be a minimum of six (6) feet in width and shall be measured only from the exterior property lines of the combined lots that create a single development site, or have a shared driveway agreement, except that the easement shall be twelve (12) feet in width along the perimeter of the certified survey. Easements shall not be required on property lines shared with greenways or public streets. No buildings, driveways, or retaining walls shall be placed in any easement for drainage purposes. Fences may be placed in the easement only if they do not impede the anticipated flow of water.

NOTE: In the event of a City of Madison Plan Commission and/or Common Council approved redivision of a previously subdivided property, the underlying public easements for drainage purposes are released and replaced by those required and created by the current approved subdivision.

48. All outstanding Madison Metropolitan Sewerage District (MMSD) and City of Madison sanitary sewer connection charges are due and payable prior to Engineering sign-off, unless otherwise collected with a Developer's / Subdivision Contract. Contact Janet Dailey (608-261-9688) to obtain the final MMSD billing a minimum of two (2) working days prior to requesting City Engineering signoff.
49. Wisconsin Administrative Code A-E 7.08 identifies when Public Land System (PLS) tie sheets must be filed with the Dane County Surveyor's office. The Developer's Surveyor and/or Applicant must submit copies of required tie sheets or condition reports for all monuments, including center of sections of record, used in this survey, to Eric Pederson, City Engineering. If a new tie sheet is not required under A-E 7.08, Engineering requests a copy of the latest tie sheet on record with Dane County Surveyor's office. The applicant shall identify monument types on all PLS corners included on the Plat or CSM.

NOTE: Land tie to two PLS corners required.

50. Prior to Engineering final sign-off by main office for Certified Survey Maps (CSM), final CSM must be submitted to Engineering Division Surveyor / Land Records Coordinator for final technical review and approval. This submittal must occur a minimum of two working days prior to final Engineering Division sign-off. Electronic mail submittal of the FINAL CSM in PDF form is preferred. Transmit to epederson@cityofmadison.com.

NOTE: Permits for Nos. 42-45 are available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact John Leach, 267-8755)

51. No residential parking permits shall be issued for 1246 to 1252 Williamson Street and 308 to 310 South Baldwin Street, as this would be consistent with other projects in the area. In addition, the applicant shall inform all tenants of this facility of the requirement in their apartment leases and note in a revised Zoning Text that no residential parking permits shall be issued. In addition, the applicant shall submit for 1246 to 1252 Williamson Street and 308 to 310 South Baldwin Street a copy of the lease noting the above condition in the lease when submitting plans for City approval. Please contact William Knobeloch or Bill Putman, Parking Utility at 266-4761 if you have questions regarding the above item.

52. When the applicant submits final plans of one contiguous plan for approval, the applicant shall show the following: items in the terrace as existing (e.g., signs and street light poles), type of surfaces, existing property lines, addresses, showing all easements, all pavement markings, building

placement, and stalls, adjacent driveway approaches to lots on either side and across the street, signage, percent of slope, vehicle routes, dimensions of radii, aisles, driveways, stalls including the two (2) feet overhang, and a scaled drawing at 1" = 20'.

53. All directional/regulatory signage and pavement markings on the site shall be shown and noted on the plan.
54. The Developer shall post a deposit and reimburse the City for all costs associated with any modifications to Traffic Signals, Street Lighting, Signing and Pavement Marking, and conduit and handholes, including labor, engineering and materials for both temporary and permanent installations.
55. Public signing and marking related to the development may be required by the City Traffic Engineer for which the developer shall be financially responsible.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

56. The Madison Water Utility shall be notified to remove the water meter prior to demolition.
57. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility.

Parks Division (Contact Tom Maglio, 266-6518)

58. The developer shall pay approximately \$58,661.90 for park dedication and development fees for the 31 new multifamily units, minus credits for the single-family home proposed for demolition.

2009 Fee Calculation

fees in lieu of dedication = (31 mf units X \$1,407.00 per unit)	=	\$43,617.00
<u>park development fees = (31 mf units X \$586.05 per unit)</u>	=	<u>\$18,167.55</u>
Subtotal: fees before credits	=	\$ 61,784.55
credits = (1 sf unit x 3,122.65 combined fee)	=	(\$ 3,122.65)
Total fees	=	\$58,661.90

NOTE: A method for payment of park fees must be determined before signoff on the rezoning, and the total may change based on which year the fees are paid.

Fire Department (Contact Scott Strassburg, 261-9843)

59. Provide fire apparatus access as required by Comm 62.0509 and MGO 34.19, as follows: The site plans shall clearly identify the location of all fire lanes.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not submit comments for this request.