

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 16, 2009	
TITLE: 400 Block State Street – Lisa Link Peace Park Improvements in the C4 District. 4 th Ald. Dist. (14907)	REFERRED:	
	REREFERRED:	
	REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: September 16, 2009	ID NUMBER:	

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 16, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of improvements to the Lisa Link Peace Park located in the 400 Block of State Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Susan Schmitz, representing DMI; Carter Arndt, representing MSA Professional Services; Bill Bauer, representing Madison Parks Division; Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central Bid; Ken Saiki, representing Ken Saiki Design; and Tom Link.

The modified plans, as presented, featured the following:

- The addition of a “peace pole” feature at the State Street entry to the park based on a response to the Commission’s request to provide a greater tie between the park’s honoring peace and Elizabeth Link. Saiki noted that the philosopher stones, as well as quotations on benches and other features within the park would also be maintained to provide direct reference to the park’s theme.
- Due to budgeting reasons the building has been redesigned to eliminate the dome feature which is now a one story masonry building featuring widened window openings, more glass and a transitional door between glass openings along the stage side of the building. The building also utilizes Renaissance stone as an alternative to the suggestion for the use of Wisconsin based stone, in addition to the use of a cast stone base with the pilasters at the base and pulled back along the park side.

Following the presentation, Mary Carbine spoke in favor of the project, as well as the introduction of an ATM machine adjacent to the observation window of the visitor center. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Looks great on architecture.
- Prefer tilted circular wall base for the peace pole. Obtain wood from around the world for the different continents to be utilized on the pole.
- The ATM is an architectural intrusion. A response by Mary Carbine noted that the ATM brings funding in at approximately \$3500/year of income per lease. It would be a visitor center amenity that encourages

spending in the area and will be surcharge free. The income allows for offsetting of the cost of operations.

- Appreciate research on peace poles like peace pole, especially the foresighted version.
- Consider eliminating the trellis in favor of up lighting and down lighting the banners and piers.
- Concern with ATM signage. It should be minimal, on-screen only or may be pushed letters with routed faces.
- Concern with commercial intrusion the ATM represents within the public park. Additional testimony by Ald. Verveer noted that the Park Commission's approval of the ATM required a minimal presence with the on-screen display, as well as signage.
- The building is more successful with the trellis.
- Issue with the refuse from the ATM receipts. Issues with waste can not provided and/or its appearance.
- Issue with ATM's affect on pan handlers per City Ordinance. In response, Ald. Verveer noted the ATM does present an issue within a 50' zone for pan handlers which is not intentional, but done as a benefit for visitors.
- Confirm with the ATM's affects on pan handling and the culture within a 50' radius affecting their ability to utilize the park.
- Concern with proposed seating affecting existing users in regards to adequate numbers and types of seating.
- A count of the seating capacity doesn't appear to be an issue.
- The ATM is an issue.
- Make seating around the circle's benches adequate to seat three on each bench.
- Like what's been done.
- Happy about the dome feature being removed. Like signage and park, but ATM is a social control design element. Will kick some types of people out of the park; therefore can't support.
- Fill in gaps between pair benches and increase seating.

Tom Link spoke in support, but voiced concern about the lack of a bump out of the park into the Gilman Street ROW as previously proposed with earlier versions of the park improvements.

ACTION:

On a motion by Luskin, seconded by Wagner, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. Motion was amended by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to require six foot benches. On a vote of (5-3) with Luskin, Harrington and Wagner voting no; with Barnett, Rummel, Slayton, Weber, and Ferm voting yes, with Smith abstaining. The main motion was passed on a vote of (5-3) with Ferm, Barnett, and Rummel voting no; with Luskin, Harrington, Wagner, Slayton, and Weber voting yes and Smith abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 7, 7, 7 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 400 Block State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
	7	6	6	-	6	6	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	9	7	9	8	8	9	9	8
	6	6	8	8	6	8	8	7
	7	6	6	6	-	6	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Your attention to detail and the meaning of the park are going to be perceived in the space.
- Worried about building transparency.
- Addition of an ATM at 12th hour, which will prohibit pan handling, is in bad form. Beautiful design of site.
- Miss the tower but the project is strong.
- Improved “peace” signage is welcome, peace pole is cool idea. But ATM on outside wall is a social control device and not welcome. Put it inside. Park design OK. Appreciate elimination of roof cone, not appropriate for a historic commercial district.

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: August 5, 2009
TITLE: 400 State Street – Lisa Link Peace Park Improvements in the C4 District. 4 th Ald. Dist. (14907)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: August 5, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, Ron Luskin and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 5, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the Lisa Link Peace Park improvements. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mike Sturm and Ken Saiki, representing Ken Saiki Design; Carter Arndt, representing MSA Professional Services; Bill Bauer, representing City of Madison Parks Division; and Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central BID. Prior to the presentation staff apprised the Commission of an ordinance amendment to allow for modifications to the height restrictions of buildings within the C4 Central Commercial District for City-owned parks when approved as a conditional use, which was just recently introduced and would allow for the Urban Design Commission's current consideration of a 1-story option for the park facility as currently proposed. Staff noted if the ordinance amendment failed, the project would require modifications to meet the current requirement for the establishment of 2-story structures on zoning lots which abut State Street. The revised plans featured the following:

- Incorporation of a full glass door and longer window openings on the stage side elevation (northeast).
- A redesign of the Gilman Street frontage provides for bicycle parking within the right-of-way.
- The incorporation of Philosopher's stone arrangements at the State Street entry featuring peace related quotations, hopefully by Lisa Link, and on benches within the circular seating area of the park's center.
- Building exterior changes emphasize the exposure of the return of the turret element at the corner as an interface between the State Street and stage side façade.
- A review of the building materials/color palette was provided, along with details of the signage concept.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Issue with the overall design elements providing an expression of a "Peace Park." The Philosopher's stones combined with quotations and signage may not be enough to speak to the tradition of peace in Madison with some sensitivity.
- Issue with the cone shape versus cylinder shape for the round element as differentially detailed within perspective renderings and various building elevations. In some instances, the cone appears to have a steep angle with less of a slope on other versions of the renderings; don't like the steep angle.

- Like cone with steep slope but reduce size and/or number of base projections below the vertical pilasters on the stage side elevation.
- Suggest the use of Wisconsin stone rather than manufactured stone.
- Replace the use of blue corian with stainless steel, stone or metal.
- Although the formal tree arrangement at the State Street entry was previously recommended, it conflicts; the third tree within the arrangement with an adjacent planter. As an alternative, move third tree to reduce its conflicts with the planter around the corner of the adjacent building.
- Relative to landscaping, adjust tree arrangement at State Street out of a four cluster pattern with the slight movement of the third tree around the corner of adjacent building.
- Add more bike parking within the Gilman Street right-of-way that relates to the circulation pattern plan for the park.
- Replace the use of Virginia Creeper and Viburnum due to maintenance issues.
- Architecture still doesn't fit context of State Street, especially historic buildings in area; need to consider a 2-story building consistent with the requirements of the C4 District.
- Design has gotten really nice.
- How much seating is provided today versus with proposal? Bring back comparative information.
- Play up theater appearance of the park side wall/façade more.
- Agree with Wagner on the on the extreme slope of the dome feature as not appropriate. Replace the use of corian due to its scratchability.
- The philosopher's stone needs to have Lisa Link quotes, graphics need more of Lisa Link and peace themes.
- Use stone benches to provide larger text opportunities for peace quotes, including walkways to distribute quotes throughout the park.
- Like the stone/masonry treatment of the State Street elevation, the horizontal banding on north (stage wall) is not necessary, eliminate spandrel glass on State Street and pull up stone base as a substitute.
- Like the four tree arrangement as a gateway to State Street as is.
- Need more history and message of park. Question whether or not the cone can be more of an artistic element rather than architecture.
- Make benches around the performance/jet spray feature longer than 4-feet, along with consideration for reducing the number of jets.
- Use frosted glass on the bottom panels on State Street as with the application on the stage side elevation within restrooms.
- Don't use blue tinted glass, use clear vision glass.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-2) with Luskin and Rummel voting no. The motion required address of the above stated comments with the motion noting that the Urban Design Commission makes a finding that based on site specific approval as a one-story building because of its size, scale and context, a park with a pavilion type structure is appropriate with the C4 Central Commercial District.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5.5, 6, 6, 6, 7, 7.5, 8 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 400 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7.5	7	7.5	7.5	7	7.5	8	7.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	7	7	7	5	-	7	7	7
	-	-	5	6	-	-	5	6
	6	6	6	-	6	6	6	6
	8	6	7	8	5	9	9	8
	6	3	6	6	4	6	7	5.5
	6	7	6	6	-	6	7	6.5
	9	7	9	9	-	10	10	9

General Comments:

- A lot of very skilled designers at work here.
- Wonderful improvements.
- Lisa Link “story” still needed.
- Park plan is very successful. Need more of Lisa Link’s story and develop connection to world-wide peace park movement.
- The architecture doesn’t address park design or State Street. The cone/cylinder appears tacked on. Peace – Lisa Link – Women’s International League for Peace & Freedom missing for signage/feel of park. Make sure there is enough seating to make everyone feel welcome.
- A vibrant architecture in a somewhat subdued site design. More could be given to energize the site.
- Continues to improve. Simplify performance elevation. Alternative to corian.