

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** March 2, 2011

TITLE: 4120-4208 East Washington Avenue
(Frontage Road) – Conditional Use Permit
for a Commercial/Retail Center that
Includes Two Drive-Thrus, an Outdoor
Eating Area and a Demolition in UDD No.
5. 17th Ald. Dist. (21199) **REFERRED:**
REREFERRED:
REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: March 2, 2011 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins, Jay Handy and Henry Lufler, Jr.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 2, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the conditional use permit and a demolition located at 4120-4208 East Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project was Jerry Bourquin. Appearing in opposition was Kim Burns. Bourquin presented changes to the plans since their last meeting with the Commission. A sidewalk and entrances have been added to the front of the building and more variety has been added to the landscape plan. They have created the possibility for entrances off the front of the building and different window patterning. Materials will include masonry, precast stone, split face block, brick and metal fascia. Two 5-stall bicycle racks will be installed within outdoor patio areas at the row. Staff mentioned that after discussion within the Planning Division, it is the decision of the Urban Design Commission as to whether or not there is a need for functioning doors for individual tenancies at the street. Comments and questions were as follows:

- You’ve got all the same species of shrubs on both sides; you’ve got to have more diversity than that.
- We don’t like to see short trees in parking lots where they are adjacent to stalls where people can open their car doors into them. They also create blind spots for people. If you could convert those to canopy trees I’d really appreciate that.
- Relocate the Hawthorne further down (halfway) the island.
- These lawn areas – I’d really encourage you to rethink lawn because they have to be mowed and watered. Ground cover would be cheaper and easier maintenance.
- In the front where you still have stone, what’s going in where the edging pulls away from the sidewalk?
 - Mulch.Just fill that whole area in.
- Eliminate standard species like spirea, burning bush, etc. in favor of native alternatives.
- You need to add your landscape point sheet on the plan and make sure you get the Registered Landscape Architect seal on it.
- Stay away from the Crabapples in areas where car doors open up.
- I like the idea of having a parapet that hides the HVAC equipment.

- Maybe look at a taller window element. I encourage you to make them a bit more unique.
- Need to have real entrances on East Washington Avenue to accommodate future connectivity to sidewalks and bus riders with doors that need to be active. Need operational doors.
- Projecting canopies should relate to doors and bays on the façade.
- The nature of the location of this site lends itself to having active doors that face East Washington Avenue.
- Continue to work on the horizontal masonry. Look at how things wrap the corner.
- You have some height where you could change the fenestration from storefront to storefront and still hit the datum lines. Maybe on the corner you have windows up 12 or 14 feet. I think that would be an inexpensive way to give somebody a rather spectacular space. Need to match shared datum line across individual storefronts; especially endcaps. Use of 16' floor to ceiling heights to have 1-2 storefronts to have clearstory windows in each individual building.
- The pilasters feel like they are pushing into the interior.

Kim Burns spoke as someone whose backyard sits adjacent to this parking lot. Her concern is the height of this project and if it will damage the view she and her neighbors have. She is happy to see improvements to this site. She mentioned that the waste removal can cause problems with “critters” and she hopes that since this is another restaurant the waste removal will be more thorough, in addition noting concern with noise and visual impacts. She would be happy to see more landscaping along the back of the building and along row lot line.

Ald. Judy Compton spoke noting the need to make sure that rooftop mechanicals would be adequately screened from view by adjacent residential properties and the need to provide high walled/secured trash dumpster to discourage their use for illegal activities.

ACTION:

On a motion by Smith, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion provided for the following:

- The landscape plan shall be modified to address the stated connects and shall return for final review.
- The addition of the doors on the south elevation facing East Washington Avenue.
- Change of island trees planting to provide for the use of canopy trees.
- Elevational details shall be provided that address the comments relevant to clearstory windows, datum lines, architectural detailing and operational doors on the East Washington Avenue façade of both buildings.
- The applicant shall provide elevations and plans that detail the relationship of the proposed development with the residential homes behind the buildings.
- The applicant shall bring visual exhibits that provide that the screening of the HVAC units is sufficient when viewed from adjacent single-family and commercial properties, as well as the right-of-way.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4120-4208 East Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	5	5	-	-	5	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	6	5	4	6	-	5	6	5
	6	6	6	6	-	6	6	6
	5	5	5	-	-	6	6	5
	5	6	4	-	-	5	6	5

General Comments:

- Address the street with real doors.
- Plantings need to be more creative and consider parking function (visibility and clearance and disease diversity).
- Good for site context and type of use.
- Improved from previous submittal – please respond to comments, they are worthwhile.
- Do not plant grass adjacent to stalls (low branches and visibility are issues).