

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: November 7, 2012

TITLE: 202, 210 North Bassett Street and 512, 520 West Dayton Street – PUD-SIP for a 75-Unit Apartment Building, 4th Ald. Dist. (28193)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: November 7, 2012

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Tom DeChant, Melissa Huggins, Cliff Goodhart, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley and Marsha Rummel.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of November 7, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD-GDP located at 202, 210 North Bassett Street and 512, 520 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce and Scott Faust. Bruce presented changes to the 5-story building. The entry has been moved to the street facing corner accented with the roof architecture. The commercial space also has additional openings at the street level. The other change made was moving from bay elements on top of the brick mass to a metal panel that comes down the face of the building from the top. The Secretary noted the need to make findings on the Downtown Design Zones criteria. Heather Stouder stated that at this time Planning Division staff does not have any major concerns, with a more detailed analysis is needed for the number of bicycle and moped parking stalls, adequacy of interior space, etc. Bruce addressed the design issues relative to common space to support the housing units. He noted that the bulk standards can be relaxed as long as the project is consistent with the Downtown Plan, and in this case the project is higher than the 3 stories that would otherwise be allowed in this area. The five-stories proposed is consistent with the Downtown Plan recommendation of a maximum of 6-stories, and the setbacks are adequately met with the exception of the rear yard; the applicant has made it clear that the design of the rear yard is a modulation of the building with the courtyard taking up the slack for what would otherwise be required for the backyard.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- To park your bike you would go back the full length? I caution you about the probability of residents locking their bicycles to these streetscape trees.
- Reexamine the “purple mass” to be sure it isn’t visible from those interior units.
- I’m assuming you’ll want some signage somewhere.
 - Yes, probably on top of this canopy here. And some building signage.You’ve done a lot to define the entrance for the residents, but I would really like that piece to have a big presence. The entrance to a building, to a home is very important. Right now the commercial entrance has bigger doors and more glass. Think about how you would give the residential use a bigger presence.

- Look into how much sun your courtyard is going to get; look at plaza for sufficiency of sunlight.
 - I like the top floor much more now.
 - The angle supporting the overhangs, that's decoration or is that needed?
 - It was initially intended as decoration. Whether we can cantilever the roofline without it, we'd have to modify that.
- That might give it a greater strength.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202, 210 North Bassett Street and 512, 520 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	6	6	4	-	-	5	6	6
	5	7	5	-	-	5	7	7

**Combined Mifflin West District, CNI and State - Langdon Neighborhood Association
Steering Committee Meeting
Capitol Lakes Private Dining Room, 333 W Main St.
Tuesday, November 13, 2012**

re: Scott Faust Proposed Frances St & Bassett/Dayton Streets Developments

Members present: SLNA - John Magnino, CNI - Scott Kolar, Rick Broughman, Pete Ostlind, Dan Bohl

Members absent: CNI - Tim Kamps

Development Team: Scott Faust, developer, Randy Bruce, architect, Knothe & Bruce Architects

Guest: Heather Stouder, Planner, Planning Division, City of Madison

Meeting began at 4:37PM

Francis Street Proposal

Randy Bruce begins discussion of Frances St Development

Specs:

- 42 apartments
- Lot size: 50' x 100'
- Building footprint: 44' x 90'
- 8 exterior moped parking stalls
- 96 interior bike parking spots, 4 external bike parking spots
- 12 stories

Floor plans:

- Most floors have 1 one bedroom, 1 two bedroom, 2 three bedrooms
- Laundry on each floor
- Furnished units
- Study room and roof deck on 11th floor

Barrel Vault roof:

- Point of discussion with city staff
- Diminish the box for mechanical housing on top?

North face of the building

-After discussions with city staff, more windows have been added to the North face of the building increase the aesthetic appeal from University Ave

Questions and suggestions from the Steering Committee members:

Scott Kolar asks about the possibility of changing the floor plan of the basement, as a long hallways separates the back entrance for bicycles from the actually bike parking area

-Randy says that they are working on changing the floor plan to better accommodate both bike parking and the storage area for the commercial space

Scott Kolar asks about ice and snow accrual on rooftop. Does not want any injuries relating to icicles and snow falling from roof

- Randy assures that bars can be placed to ensure this does not happen
- Randy also states that roof may flatten out on each sides of barrel vault, thus allowing for snow to settle on roof

John Magnino asks about key fobs and entry to the building

-Scott Faust says they are still looking into the issue, but likely that front building access and elevator access will rely on fobs, while keys will be used for rooms

-Whether or not a fob will allow access to all floors is to be determined

Pete asks whether or not the lights in the stairwells will be on 24/7, citing the issue with spillover-light as a problem in past developments

-Randy and Scott say that putting the lights in the stairways on motion sensors a definite possibility to save energy and reduce light pollution

Randy describes the materials that will make up the façade of the building:

-The first two floors will mostly be a prairie/renaissance stone around the entrance and commercial space

-A sandstone-looking material will make up most of the middle floors of the building

-At the top will be darker grey

Heather Stouder expands on the concerns from the city staff. She states the three greatest concerns are: Height, Density and the North Façade.

-**Density:** This development would be the most densely populated area in the city of Madison with approximately 850 beds/acre. As a comparison, she says Grand Central has about 650 beds/acre.

-The biggest concern is that the building serves the density of residents well enough.

-**Height:** The building is twelve stories and is proposed to be built on the footprint currently occupied by two houses.

-**North Façade:** Heather says the design team has made significant improvements on this issue since meeting with the Urban Design Commission and is working toward future improvements.

She states that the building does not meet many of the downtown design standards, such as the size of the setbacks. In order to get approval from the city, she says it must "knock out" the PUD requirements.

The discussion of the Frances St development concluded.

Bassett/Dayton Streets Proposal

Randy Bruce begins the discussion of the Bassett/Dayton Development:

Specs:

- 75 Apartments, 120 beds
- Vehicular access to guest parking off Bassett St
- Vehicular access to underground parking off Dayton St
- Two main entrances, one entrance to commercial space
- Centrally located patio
- 20 moped parking stalls
- 80 interior bike parking spots, 54 exterior bike parking spots
- Five stories

Sixth story in original plans was removed

Exterior:

- Brick on face
- Fiber cement panels on balconies

Comments and Suggestions from the Steering Committee:

General consensus that the main entrance is too understated, and it appears as though the commercial entrance is in fact the main entrance

Questions regarding the central patio area

- Location of second entrance

-Availability of grilling stations? Prevents tenants from bringing their own grills and using them on private balconies

Questions about drive entering underground parking and trash removal

- Discussions going on between transportation and zoning about the entry drive
- Space allows for trucks to pull in and turn around
- Plenty of space for garbage trucks

Heather says the concerns of the city are mostly "small details at this point."

Meeting concluded at 5:50PM