

## AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: October 3, 2012

TITLE: 313 & 315 North Frances Street –  
PUD(SIP), Deconstruction of Two  
Residential Buildings and Construction of  
a New 12-Story Student Housing Building  
with First Floor Commercial Space. 4<sup>th</sup>  
Ald. Dist. (27839)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: October 3, 2012

ID NUMBER:

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Richard Slayton, Henry Lufler, Melissa Huggins and Cliff Goodhart.

### SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 3, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for the deconstruction of two residential buildings and construction of a new 12-story student housing building located at 313 & 315 North Frances Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce and Scott Faust, representing Boardwalk Investment. Staff noted the comments from Bill Fruhling, Principal Planner and excerpts from the Downtown Design Zone No. 2, highlighting areas Bruce is requesting exceptions from; they include the need to waive the applicable provisions relative to extra stories, floor area ratio, yard requirements (front, side and rear) and setback if bonus stories are granted. Staff further noted that recent ordinance revisions allow for a waiver of Downtown Design Zone 2 (DDZ2) provisions with a finding that the approval criteria for Planned Unit Developments (PUDs) in Section 28.07(6)(f), Zoning Code is met; adherence to the guidelines for DD2 is required, which is not probably if the applicant is requesting this significant level of a waiver. Bruce presented the site plan across from the Fluno Center. Two small wood frame houses are currently on the site and will be demolished. There's a private alley that runs between University Avenue and Conklin Place for deliveries. This site is one of the reasons for the relaxed requirements in the Downtown Design Zone Districts to allow for some flexibility. The front street yard and backside requirements for the site would leave nothing left for building. Fruhling feels that perhaps this is too much building for the site; 10-stories would be fine but Bruce thinks it will be a better building at 12-stories. The slenderness of the building is actually what makes it exciting and kind of interesting. It reaches up and has a metal top and sits like a beacon; as it shortens you take away from that. First floor commercial space would run across Frances Street with 11 floors of housing above that. Level 10 would include a rooftop terrace. Bicycle parking is in the basement.

- It looks very blank at the stair tower.
- If it came down to it that 12-stories is too tall, is it possible to make that metal area narrower so it doesn't feel as squashed? Has Jeff Stanley weighed in on this?
  - I imagine he'll be very happy.

I like the way it stands out, it's very attractive.

- There's no parking?
  - There's no car parking, it's strictly student housing.
- If you reduced the height of the metal panel to 1-story, not the building height, it almost seems like the heaviness is too much versus just letting the building go up. Really accentuate the slenderness that way and the cast stone at the base might be a little heavy and rustic for a nice sleek, tall building like this. It has really nice proportions, nice glass to solid wall proportions. I would encourage less stylistic up here, bring it up to a nice thin top and encourage something really iconic here.
  - We're trying to express those two stories not as "bonus stories" but as the top of the building. Some of the projects downtown don't have a termination and I thought this one did. When you come back you could show us the tops of other buildings. Staff reminded Bruce that we need that detailed discussion of the Downtown Design Zone criteria.

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

**REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION**

**PRESENTED:** November 7, 2012

**TITLE:** 313 & 315 North Frances Street –  
PUD(SIP), Deconstruction of Two  
Residential Buildings and Construction of  
a New 12-Story Student Housing Building  
with First Floor Commercial Space. 4<sup>th</sup>  
Ald. Dist. (27839)

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

**AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

**DATED:** November 7, 2012

**ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Tom DeChant, Cliff Goodhart, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley and Marsha Rummel.

\*Huggins was excused at 6:15 p.m.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of November 7, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a PUD(SIP) located at 313 and 315 North Frances Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce and Scott Faust. Bruce presented revisions to the proposal through elevational photos. Changes made include loading at the back of the site, 8 moped stalls in the rear and a rear entrance to the building. Four bicycle stalls will be locate parallel to the building along Conklin Place. The first floor will accommodate 2,000 square feet of commercial space. Stairs to the basement are wider with a sizable ramp alongside of it for storage of up to 96 bicycles in the basement in an attempt to provide one bicycle stall per bedroom. The building materials will include vertical metal panels.

Heather Stouder of the Planning Division spoke to the improvement of the north façade and the proximity to the side lot line. There are still concerns about the complete maxing out of this property. It’s not necessarily about height and density; the height issue relates to the Downtown Design Zone standards and whether or not they meet the bonus story criteria. Planning Division staff didn’t see a clear reason in the design to have those two extra stories. The stepback on the eleventh floor helps bring this project closer to meeting that criteria. The density is the greatest in the City in terms of bedrooms per acre. Staff isn’t concerned with the density in and of itself, as long as that density can be well supported within the programming of the building and site. Their major concern comes down to the fact that the site and the interior program might still be inadequate to serve the density being proposed. There is hardly any moped parking provided (less than 10%). This project “blows the design standards out of the water.” The building as proposed now doesn’t meet the standards for the UMX Urban Mixed Use District (future zoning district at this location). Land use/design issues include lack of moped parking, bicycle parking, lack of storage, and lack of a detailed floor plan. Precedent is also an issue with such a small lot, they are unsure if this small space can support the programming of this building.

Comments and questions were as follows:

- That's a long distance for the bicycles to go to the basement and I wonder how many will actually use it. They'll put them in places we don't want them.
  - They can use the elevator also. And realistically people with expensive bicycles will take them up to their apartments.
- Is there still a height issue? Yes, in address of the Design Criteria.
- I'd like to see some studies on the building without the barrel vault; I think it accentuates the height of the building beyond its 12 stories. I think this is a really nice looking building but the top detracts from what you've got as a really nice design.
- I don't mind the barrel but if you do go with a flat roof, look at green roofs.
- What if instead of "holding the building down" the roof expresses itself and is open ended. You have this very nice asymmetrical read starting which could lead to the spring point of a roof form that's not symmetrical.
- It seems like you're trying to shoehorn this building on too small a lot. I think you're not really meeting the standards.
- Your three-story base feels like a gesture to relate to your three-story neighbor, but a four-story base would also relate to your neighbor. Or a tall three-stories. For your overall composition and the strength of your building composition I would look at increasing the height of that.

**ACTION:**

On a motion by Rummel, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item in order to provide address of the Exterior and Interior Design Criteria as it applies to Downtown Design Zone 2. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-3) with Huggins, Slayton and Lufler voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6 and 8.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 313 & 315 North Frances Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	5	-	5	-	-	-	-	5
	-	8	-	-	-	-	7	8
	5	6	-	-	-	5	7	6

**General Comments:**

- Too much program for a very small space.

**Combined Mifflin West District, CNI and State - Langdon Neighborhood Association  
Steering Committee Meeting  
Capitol Lakes Private Dining Room, 333 W Main St.  
Tuesday, November 13, 2012**

re: Scott Faust Proposed Frances St & Bassett/Dayton Streets Developments

Members present: SLNA - John Magnino, CNI - Scott Kolar, Rick Broughman, Pete Ostlind, Dan Bohl

Members absent: CNI - Tim Kamps

Development Team: Scott Faust, developer, Randy Bruce, architect, Knothe & Bruce Architects

Guest: Heather Stouder, Planner, Planning Division, City of Madison

Meeting began at 4:37PM

**Francis Street Proposal**

Randy Bruce begins discussion of Frances St Development

**Specs:**

- 42 apartments
- Lot size: 50' x 100'
- Building footprint: 44' x 90'
- 8 exterior moped parking stalls
- 96 interior bike parking spots, 4 external bike parking spots
- 12 stories

**Floor plans:**

- Most floors have 1 one bedroom, 1 two bedroom, 2 three bedrooms
- Laundry on each floor
- Furnished units
- Study room and roof deck on 11<sup>th</sup> floor

**Barrel Vault roof:**

- Point of discussion with city staff
- Diminish the box for mechanical housing on top?

**North face of the building**

-After discussions with city staff, more windows have been added to the North face of the building increase the aesthetic appeal from University Ave

**Questions and suggestions from the Steering Committee members:**

Scott Kolar asks about the possibility of changing the floor plan of the basement, as a long hallways separates the back entrance for bicycles from the actually bike parking area

-Randy says that they are working on changing the floor plan to better accommodate both bike parking and the storage area for the commercial space

Scott Kolar asks about ice and snow accrual on rooftop. Does not want any injuries relating to icicles and snow falling from roof

- Randy assures that bars can be placed to ensure this does not happen
- Randy also states that roof may flatten out on each sides of barrel vault, thus allowing for snow to settle on roof

John Magnino asks about key fobs and entry to the building

-Scott Faust says they are still looking into the issue, but likely that front building access and elevator access will rely on fobs, while keys will be used for rooms

-Whether or not a fob will allow access to all floors is to be determined

Pete asks whether or not the lights in the stairwells will be on 24/7, citing the issue with spillover-light as a problem in past developments

-Randy and Scott say that putting the lights in the stairways on motion sensors a definite possibility to save energy and reduce light pollution

Randy describes the materials that will make up the façade of the building:

-The first two floors will mostly be a prairie/renaissance stone around the entrance and commercial space

-A sandstone-looking material will make up most of the middle floors of the building

-At the top will be darker grey

Heather Stouder expands on the concerns from the city staff. She states the three greatest concerns are: Height, Density and the North Façade.

-**Density:** This development would be the most densely populated area in the city of Madison with approximately 850 beds/acre. As a comparison, she says Grand Central has about 650 beds/acre.

-The biggest concern is that the building serves the density of residents well enough.

-**Height:** The building is twelve stories and is proposed to be built on the footprint currently occupied by two houses.

-**North Façade:** Heather says the design team has made significant improvements on this issue since meeting with the Urban Design Commission and is working toward future improvements.

She states that the building does not meet many of the downtown design standards, such as the size of the setbacks. In order to get approval from the city, she says it must "knock out" the PUD requirements.

The discussion of the Frances St development concluded.

### **Bassett/Dayton Streets Proposal**

Randy Bruce begins the discussion of the Bassett/Dayton Development:

Specs:

-75 Apartments, 120 beds

-Vehicular access to guest parking off Bassett St

-Vehicular access to underground parking off Dayton St

-Two main entrances, one entrance to commercial space

-Centrally located patio

-20 moped parking stalls

-80 interior bike parking spots, 54 exterior bike parking spots

-Five stories

Sixth story in original plans was removed

Exterior:

-Brick on face

-Fiber cement panels on balconies

Comments and Suggestions from the Steering Committee:

General consensus that the main entrance is too understated, and it appears as though the commercial entrance is in fact the main entrance

Questions regarding the central patio area

-Location of second entrance

-Availability of grilling stations? Prevents tenants from bringing their own grills and using them on private balconies

Questions about drive entering underground parking and trash removal

- Discussions going on between transportation and zoning about the entry drive
- Space allows for trucks to pull in and turn around
- Plenty of space for garbage trucks

Heather says the concerns of the city are mostly "small details at this point."

Meeting concluded at 5:50PM