

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

November 4, 2013

PREPARED FOR THE URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION AND PLAN COMMISSION



Project Address: 502 Apollo Way
Application Type: Planned Development Rezoning
Legistar File ID # [31742](#) and [31103](#)
Prepared By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Summary

Applicant: Dan Schmidt; Forward Management, Inc; 110 S. Brooks Street; Madison, WI 53715
Contact: Brian Stoddard; Avenue Architects, Inc; 550 Sunrise Drive #201; Spring Green, WI 53533
Property Owner: Same as the applicant

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval of a zoning map amendment from PD-GDP (Planned Development – General Development Plan) to amended PD-GDP-SIP (Planned Development Specific Implementation Plan)

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to construct a four-story, 105 unit apartment building.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Zoning Map Amendments [M.G.O. Section 28.182(6)] and Planned Developments [Section 28.098(2)].

Review Required By: Urban Design Commission, Plan Commission, Common Council

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for Zoning Map Amendments and Planned Developments are met and forward Zoning Map Amendment 00082, rezoning 502 Apollo Way from PD-GDP (Planned Unit Development Plan-General Development Plan) to PD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan) to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is Lot 465 of the Grandview Commons development, an approximately 4.5 acre property at the current end of Apollo Way. The site is in Aldermanic District 3 and the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The site is currently undeveloped. The site varies in grade, falling about 14 feet from the center of the site towards the adjacent stormwater facility to the south. A 19 foot tall berm is located at the rear of the property along the interstate highway.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Quarry, zoned Agriculture;

South: City-owned stormwater management facility, zoned Planned Development;

East: Single-Family Homes, zoned Planned Development; and

West: Interstate I-90/39 with single-family homes beyond.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan recommends this location for medium density residential development. That recommendation includes a general density range of 16-40 dwelling units per acre. The Sprecher Neighborhood Development Plan also recommends medium density residential development for this site. The underlying Grandview Commons General Development Plan recommends multi-family development of up to 184 units on this site.

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned PD- Planned Development

Bulk Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area Multi-family complex	600 sq. ft./d.u. + 300 per bedroom > 2 (64,200 sq.ft.)	196,607 sq. ft.
Lot width	50'	adequate
Usable open space	140 sq. ft. per d.u.	185.3 sq. ft. per d.u.
Front yard	15'	As per submitted plans
Side yards	10'	As per submitted plans
Rear yard	20'	As per submitted plans
Floor area ratio	n/a	As per submitted plans
Building height	4 stories/52'	As per submitted plans
Number parking stalls	105	185 (90 surface stalls)
Accessible stalls	6	4 surface 2 underground
Loading	No	No
Number bike parking stalls	Short term (11) Long term (95)	30 short term 109 long term
Landscaping	Yes	Yes
Lighting	Yes (if surface stalls are provided.)	Yes
Other Critical Zoning Items	Urban Design	

Table Prepared by Patrick Anderson, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project History

The General Development Plan (GDP) for the entire Grandview Commons Development was approved in 2002. Within that approval, the subject lot is identified as Lot 465 and included within the "Condominium/Apartment District." Lot 465 allows up to 184 total units or a maximum density of 40.9 dwelling units per acre. That district allows a maximum building height of 45 feet.

Project Description

The applicant proposes to construct a four-story, 105-unit apartment building.

The building includes a mix of efficiency, one, two, and three bedroom units. In total, there are 163 bedrooms proposed. A summary of the proposed dwelling unit mix is below.

	Dwelling Units	Number of Bedrooms
Studio	12	12
One-Bedroom	39	39
Two-Bedroom	50	100
Three-Bedroom	4	12
TOTAL	105	163

On-site amenities include an outdoor pool, community room, and an exercise room. There is also an on-site management office proposed.

The proposed building is generally an "H" shape with much of the mass pulled back at least 60 feet from Apollo Way. There are two street-facing projections (which are just under 70 feet in width) that are set closer to the street. The northern-most projection is set back just under 19 feet with the southern-most projection about 37 feet from Apollo Way. A driveway to the underground garage leads to a side-loaded door along the northern-most projection.

The building is clad in a combination of brick, composite lap siding, and large composite panels. The base of the building includes split face block, which is visible along portions of the exposed lower levels along the east and south elevations. The building measures 45 feet in height.

The building includes a main street-facing entrance and an entrance along the rear parking area. Four of the individual units have street-facing entrances and porches.

There will be 185 total parking stalls, with 95 of those spaces provided beneath the building. The remaining 90 parking stalls are provided to the side and rear of the building. The plans show 139 bicycle stalls are proposed, with 109 of these stalls located underground and designated for long term parking. The remaining 30 bicycle stalls are surface parking for short term visitor parking.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is subject to the Zoning Map Amendment [Section 28.182(6)] and Planned Development standards [Section 29.098(2)] of the Zoning Code. The analysis below begins with a summary of the adopted plan recommendations as the specific approval standards reference these documents.

Conformance with Adopted Plans

The project conforms to the general recommendations of adopted plans. Both the Comprehensive Plan and the Sprecher Neighborhood Development Plan recommend medium density residential development for the subject property. The recommended density is between 16 and 40 du/ac (dwelling units per acre). With a calculated density of 23.3 du/ac, the proposed project is well within the recommended density range.

Zoning Map Amendment Standards

Staff believes the Zoning Map Amendment standards can be met. These standards state that such amendments are legislative decisions of the Common Council that shall be based on public health, safety and welfare, shall be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan, and shall comply with Wisconsin and federal law.

Chapter 66.1001(3) of Wisconsin Statutes requires that zoning ordinances (of which the zoning map is part) enacted or amended after January 1, 2010 be consistent with the City's Comprehensive Plan. 2010 Wisconsin Act 372 clarified "consistent with" as "furthers or does not contradict the objectives, goals and policies contained in the comprehensive plan." Staff believes that the project is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan as noted above.

Planned Development Standards

Staff also believes the Planned Development standards can likely be met. The standards include the facilitation of adopted plans, economic health of the area, parking and traffic impacts, and project implementation. As discussed below, staff's primary questions on this proposal relate to the architectural style and building form standard. The Zoning Code requires that the Urban Design Commission (UDC) review and make a recommendation to the Plan Commission on Planned Development proposals based on the objectives in the statement of purpose and other standards in this section.

Design Related Considerations

Staff's primary recommendations on the proposed project relate to the architectural style and building form standard [Standard 28.098(e)]. The project is a very large building that must relate to single-family homes, immediately across the street.

Staff has had multiple discussions with the applicant which have resulted in improvements to the proposal. While the applicant was not willing to consider a two-building approach, the building's shape has been revised from a more-simple "L" - shape to the proposed "H" shape structure. Staff believes this relates better to the site than the initial concept. The applicant has also simplified the mass of the structure, removing previously proposed upper-floor cantilevered sections. A street-facing building entrance to the lobby has also been provided. While these changes have improved the project, staff believes further modifications would enhance the project and better respond to the surrounding context. The following are provided for the consideration of the Urban Design Commission:

- **Better Articulate Exposed Lower Levels.** Visible portions of the east and south facades have considerable portions of the building base exposed. Currently, these are proposed to be clad in split face block. One of the street-facing projections on the east side has a lower level exposure up to about eight feet. Portions of the south elevation have more than nine-feet of such exposure. Staff believes a variety of architectural solutions could be appropriate including bringing down the brick veneer, creating openings or windows in the wall, or creating further vertical articulation through piers or other techniques.
- **Better Articulate Street Facing Projections.** As noted above, the east facade has two primary projections that are closer to the street compared to the main mass of the building. Staff believes the appearance of these facades is especially important. On the northern projection, staff would first recommend that the units be configured to allow for a ground-level porch and entry, similar to other street-facing units. Staff also believes consideration should be given to relocating the balconies from the side to the front of the façade. This may be most appropriate within the area that is slightly set back, allowing the balcony to be “in-set” and not just “attached” to the façade. Additionally, staff believes the composite panels should not “dip” down into the second floor and that the materials change consistently above the third floor on these projections. Staff believes similar treatments should be included on the southern projection, including consideration of adding a walk-up type balcony(ies) that would also address the above concern regarding the large, unarticulated building base.
- **Additional Masonry.** Staff believes a building of this size should include a substantial amount of masonry, and that the brick should be the predominant exterior material for this building. Along the front façade, staff believes that consistent masonry should be added to at least the ground floor. Along the rear façade, which will have visible from the interstate, additional brick is recommended, including along the northernmost projection.
- **Landscape Plan.** Staff also believes that the front landscape plan should be enhanced along the street-facing entry. The front entryway should be treated in a similar fashion to the rear façade, in which the plantings create a more extensive courtyard highlighting that entrance.
- **“Wall Pack Units.”** Staff has concerns on the visual prominence of the “wall pack” louvers.

General Planning Standards – Highway Noise Land Use Provisions

The General Planning ordinance (Chapter 16) includes construction restrictions for habitable structures and their outdoor use areas adjacent to federal expressways. Specifically, the code requires that “interior hourly traffic induced sound level” for habitable rooms in new multi-family dwellings shall not exceed 52 dBA (A-Weighted Decible). Outdoor use areas, such as the pool area, shall not exceed 67 dBA. A condition of approval is recommended that such confirmations are provided on plans submitted for final sign-off.

Public Input

At the time of report writing, staff has not received any comments on the proposed request.

Conclusion

The applicant proposes to rezone the property from PD-GDP (Planned Development-General Development Plan) to PD-SIP (Planned Development-Specific Implementation Plan) to allow for the construction of a four-story, 105 unit building with 163 total bedrooms. The plans conform to the underlying GDP, which allows for up to 184 units on this 4.5 acre site.

The resulting building is a large, "H"- shaped structure. Compatibility with the single-family homes is an important consideration. The applicant has pulled much of the building's mass back about 60 feet from the street, with two projections set closer to the frontage. Staff believes from a massing standpoint, this helps to break up the mass and create a more appropriate transition. In preliminary meetings with staff, this applicant was not willing to pursue multiple smaller buildings on this property.

Staff have recommended some design changes for the consideration of the Urban Design and Plan Commissions, primarily related to facade details. At this time, these are being offered for the Commission's consideration and not included as formal conditions of approval.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Kevin Firchow, 267-1150)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for Zoning Map Amendments and Planned Developments are met and forward Zoning Map Amendment 00082, rezoning 502 Apollo Way from PD-GDP (Planned Unit Development Plan-General Development Plan) to PD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan) to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Kevin Firchow, 267-1150)

1. That plans comply with Highway Noise Land Use Provisions of Sec. 16.23(3)(d). A note shall be placed on the plans stating that the traffic-induced interior noise levels in the proposed building will not exceed 52 decibels and exterior highway-induced noise levels for all outdoor recreational areas will not exceed 67 decibels.
2. That the applicant receives final approval from the Urban Design Commission prior to final sign-off and recording. (Initial approval given at the October 23, 2013 meeting.)

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Dailey, 261-9688)

3. The Site Plan and Dimensioned Site Plan shall also show the location all of the easements and restrictions as shown on the Existing Site Plan.
 4. The parking lot along the north side of the site partially encroaches into the Non-exclusive Drainage Easement per Doc No. 3963053. Per the document, any grade change within any of the easement shall be approved by the City Engineer. Confirm with Jeff Benedict of City Engineering, jbenedict@cityofmadison.com to confirm if these proposed improvements within the easement conform to the existing Storm Water Drainage Plan for the development.
 5. Remove the riprap from the apron end discharges to the public pond. TRM according to the WDOT PAL shall be used.
 6. Bio2 has an elevation of 954.00 with a presumed bottom of “engineered” fill at 950 – this is at the perm elevation of water in the adjacent pond. This is unacceptable.
 7. Provide information on how the drive down to the underground parking shall be drained.
 8. Proposed sanitary sewer lateral into Apollo Way will be subject to the City of Madison patching criteria – 50-foot long mill and overlay. [Cityofmadison.com/engineering/patchingcriteria.cfm](http://cityofmadison.com/engineering/patchingcriteria.cfm)
 9. Sanitary sewer connection fees due with this development for the Heritage Prairie Sewer Assessment District.
-
10. Submit a PDF of all floor plans to izenchenko@cityofmadison.com so that a preliminary interior addressing plan can be developed. If there are any changes pertaining to the location of a unit, the deletion or addition of a unit, or to the location of the entrance into any unit, (before, during, or after construction) the addresses may need to be changed. The interior address plan is subject to the review and approval of the Fire Marshal.
 11. All work in the public right-of-way shall be performed by a City licensed contractor. (MGO 16.23(9)(c)5) and MGO 23.01)
 12. All damage to the pavement on Apollo Way, adjacent to this development shall be restored in accordance with the City of Madison’s Pavement Patching Criteria. For additional information please see the following link: <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/patchingCriteria.cfm> (POLICY)
 13. The applicant shall demonstrate compliance with Section 37.07 and 37.08 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding permissible soil loss rates. The erosion control plan shall include Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) computations for the construction period. Measures shall be implemented in order to maintain a soil loss rate below 7.5-tons per acre per year.
 14. Prior to approval, this project shall comply with Chapter 37 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding stormwater management. Specifically, this development is required to a) Provide infiltration in accordance with Chapter 37 of the Madison General Ordinances and b) Complete an erosion control plan and complete weekly self-inspection of the erosion control practices and post these inspections to the City of Madison website – as required by Chapter 37 of the Madison General Ordinances.

15. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, a digital CAD file (single file) to the Engineering Program Specialist in the Engineering Division (Lori Zenchenko). The digital CAD file shall be to scale and represent final construction. The single CAD file submittal can be either AutoCAD (dwg) Version 2001 or older, MicroStation (dgn) Version J or older, or Universal (dxf) format and contain only the following data, each on a separate layer name/level number: a) Building Footprints, b) Internal Walkway Areas, c) Internal Site Parking Areas, d) Other Miscellaneous Impervious Areas (i.e. gravel, crushed stone, bituminous/asphalt, concrete, etc.), e) Right-of-Way lines (public and private), f) All Underlying Lot lines or parcel lines if unplatted, g) Lot numbers or the words "unplatted", h) Lot/Plat dimensions, i) Street names

All other levels (contours, elevations, etc) are not to be included with this file submittal.

NOTE: Email file transmissions preferred lzenchenko@cityofmadison.com. Include the site address in the subject line of this transmittal. Any changes or additions to the location of the building, sidewalks, parking/pavement during construction will require a new CAD file. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2) & 37.05(4)).

16. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, digital PDF files to the Engineering Division (Jeff Benedict or Tim Troester). The digital copies shall be to scale, and shall have a scale bar on the plan set. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2)) PDF submittals shall contain the following information: a) building footprints, b) internal walkway areas, c) internal site parking areas, d) lot lines and right-of-way lines, e) Street names, f) Stormwater Management Facilities, and g) detail drawings associated with stormwater management facilities (including if applicable planting plans).
17. The applicant shall submit prior to plan sign-off, electronic copies of any Stormwater Management Files including: a) SLAMM DAT files; b) RECARGA files; c) TR-55/HYDROCAD/Etc... and d) Sediment loading calculations.
18. The applicant's utility contractor shall obtain a connection permit and excavation permit prior to commencing the storm sewer construction. MGO 37.05(7) This permit application is available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>.
19. Prior to approval, the owner or owner's representative shall obtain a permit to plug each existing sanitary sewer lateral that serves a building which is proposed for demolition. For each lateral to be plugged the owner shall complete a sewer lateral plugging application and pay the applicable permit fees. NOTE: As of January 1, 2013 new plugging procedures and permit fees go into effect. The new procedures and revised fee schedule is available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>. (MGO CH 35.02(14))

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, 266-6572)

20. When the applicant submits plans for approval, the applicant shall show the following on one contiguous plan: existing items in the terrace (e.g., signs and street light poles), type of surfaces, percent of slope, existing and proposed property lines, addresses, all easements, all pavement markings, building placement, adjacent driveway approaches to lots on either side and across the street, signage, semitrailer movements and vehicle routes, dimensions of radii, aisles, driveways, parking stall dimensions including the two (2) feet overhang on a scaled drawing at 1" = 20'. Contact City Traffic Engineering if you have questions.

21. The developer shall post a deposit and reimburse the City for all costs associated with any modification to traffic signals, street lighting, signing and pavement marking, and conduit/handholes, including labor, engineering and materials for both temporary and permanent installations.
22. Public signing and marking related to the development may be required by the City Traffic Engineer for which the developer shall be financially responsible.
23. All parking stalls shall conform to MGO standards as set in section 10.08(6)

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

24. Exterior lighting provided shall be in accordance with City of Madison General Ordinances Section 10.085. Provide an exterior lighting plan and fixture cut sheets, with the final plan submittal.
25. Provide the minimum bike parking stalls including guest stalls in a safe and convenient location on an impervious surface subject to section 28.141(11) to be shown on the final plan. Bike parking shall comply with City of Madison General Ordinances Table 28I-3 (General Regulations). Provide details of bike rack.
26. Pursuant to Sec. 28.142 (3) Landscape Plan and Design Standards: Landscape plans for zoning lots greater than ten thousand (10,000) square feet in size must be prepared by a registered landscape architect.
27. Parking requirements for persons with disabilities must comply with City of Madison Provide the minimum accessible stalls underground and surface accessible stalls with one being van accessible. General Ordinances Section 28.14 (4) (e) includes all applicable State accessible requirements.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

28. Provide fire apparatus access as required by IFC 503 2012 edition, MGO 34.503.
 - a. Provide a fire lane that extends to within 150-feet of all exterior portions of the structure, or it can be extended to within 250-feet if the building is fully sprinklered. This shall be measured along a walkable route. The retaining wall on the northwest side of site will restrict access from the fire lane shown on plans.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

29. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility. This property is not in a Wellhead Protection District. The Water Utility will not need to sign off the final plans, and not need a copy of the approved plans.

Parks Division (Contact Kay Rutledge, 266-4714)

30. The developer shall pay approximately \$247,107.00 for park dedication and development fees for the new 105 MF unit development.
31. The developer must select a method for payment of park fees before signoff on the conditional use.

32. Approval of plans for this project does not include any approval to prune, remove or plant trees in the public right-of-way. Permission for such activities must be obtained from the City Forester, 266-4816.
33. This development is within the Door Creek park impact fee district (SI23). Please reference ID# 13158 when contacting Parks about this project.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not provide comments for this request.